

# EXHIBIT 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
CIVIL ACTION FILE NO. 1:23-CV-480

PLANNED PARENTHOOD SOUTH	)
ATLANTIC, et al.,	)
	)
Plaintiffs,	)
	)
vs.	)
	)
JOSHUA STEIN, et al.,	)
	)
Defendants	)
	)
and	)
	)
PHILIP E. BERGER and TIMOTHY K.	)
MOORE,	)
	)
Intervenor-	)
Defendants	)

-----

---

VIDEO CONFERENCE DEPOSITION  
OF  
CHRISTY MARIE BORAAS ALSLEBEN, MD

---

TAKEN VIA VIDEO CONFERENCE AT THE OFFICES OF:  
CHAPLIN AND ASSOCIATES, INC.  
NETWORKING WITH:  
CAPE FEAR COURT REPORTING, INC.

08-29-2023  
10:06 O'CLOCK A.M.

---

Gretchen Wells  
Court Reporter

REMOTE APPEARANCES

FOR PLANNED PARENTHOOD SOUTH ATLANTIC:

Hannah Swanson, Esquire  
Kara L. Grandin, Esquire  
Anjali Salvador, Esquire  
Dylan Cowit, Esquire  
PLANNED PARENTHOOD FEDERATION OF AMERICA  
1110 Vermont Avenue NW, Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20005  
hannah.swanson@ppfa.org  
kara.grandin@ppfa.org  
anjali.salvador@ppfa.org  
dylan.cowit@ppfa.org

FOR ALL PLAINTIFFS:

Jaclyn A. Maffetore, Esquire  
ACLU OF NORTH CAROLINA  
P.O. Box 28004  
Raleigh, NC 27611  
jmaffetore@acluofnc.org

FOR THE PLAINTIFF DR. BEVERLY GRAY:

Brigitte Amiri, Esquire  
Ryan Mendias, Esquire  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004-2400  
bamiri@aclu.org  
rmendias@aclu.org

REMOTE APPEARANCES

FOR THE LEGISLATIVE LEADER DEFENDANTS  
SENATOR BERGER AND SPEAKER MOORE:

W. Ellis Boyle, Esquire  
WARD & SMITH, PA  
751 Corporate Center Drive, Suite 300  
Raleigh, NC 27607  
ewboyle@wardandsmith.com

Julia Payne, Esquire  
ALLIANCE DEFENDING FREEDOM  
15100 N. 90th Street  
Scottsdale, AZ 85260  
jpayne@adflegal.org

Denise M. Harle, Esquire  
ALLIANCE DEFENDING FREEDOM  
1000 Hurricane Shoals Rd NE, Suite D-1100  
Lawrenceville, GA 30043  
dharle@adflegal.org

Erin M. Hawley, Esquire  
ALLIANCE DEFENDING FREEDOM  
440 First Street NW, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20001  
ehawley@adflegal.org

FOR THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY JIM O'NEILL  
Kevin G. Williams  
BELL DAVIS & PITT, P.A.  
100 N. Cherry Street, Suite 600  
Winston-Salem, NC 27101

FOR ATTORNEY GENERAL JOSH STEIN:  
South A. Moore  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
14 West Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
smoore@ncdoj.gov

REMOTE APPEARANCES

FOR ALL DISTRICT ATTORNEY DEFENDANTS  
EXCEPT JIM O'NEILL:

Elizabeth C. O'Brien, Esquire  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
14 West Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
eobrien@ncdoj.gov

FOR THE NORTH CAROLINA MEDICAL BOARD,  
NORTH CAROLINA BOARD OF NURSING:

Michael E. Bulleri  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
14 West Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
mbulleri@ncdoj.gov

FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

Colleen M. Crowley, Esquire  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
14 West Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
ccrowley@ncdoj.gov

OTHER APPEARANCES

Shealyn Massey  
Planned Parenthood Federation of America  
Vanisha Kudumuri  
Planned Parenthood Federation of America  
Joshua Yost  
General Counsel, Office of the  
Senate President Pro Tempore

5

I N D E X

STIPULATIONS

6

EXAMINATION

By Mr. Boyle

10, 177

By Ms. Grandin

168

ADJOURNMENT

186

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

187

WITNESS CERTIFICATION

188

WITNESS ADDENDUM

189

E X H I B I T S

Name

Offered By

Identified

Exhibit A

All parties

7

(Declaration of Deponent)

NOTE: Quoted material has been reproduced as read or  
quoted by the speaker.

STIPULATIONS

Pursuant to Notice and/or consent of the parties,  
the deposition hereon captioned was conducted at the  
time and location indicated and was conducted before  
Gretchen Wells, Notary Public in and for the County of Iredell,  
State of North Carolina at Large.

Notice and/or defect in Notice of time, place,  
purpose and method of taking the deposition was waived.  
Formalities with regard to sealing and filing the  
deposition were waived, and it is stipulated that the  
original transcript, upon being certified by the  
undersigned court reporter, shall be made available for  
use in accordance with the applicable rules as amended.

It is stipulated that objections to questions  
and motions to strike answers are reserved until the  
testimony, or any part thereof, is offered for evidence,  
except that objection to the form of any question shall  
be noted herein at the time of the taking of the  
testimony.

Reading and signing of the testimony was requested  
prior to the filing of same for use as permitted by  
applicable rule(s).

PROCEEDINGS

(10:06 o'clock a.m.)

THE COURT REPORTER: We are now on the record. Today's date is Tuesday, August 29th, 2023, and the time is 10:06 a.m. This is the deposition of Dr. Boraas taken in the matter of Planned Parenthood South Atlantic, et al., versus Joshua Stein, et al., Defendants, and Philip E. Berger and Timothy K. Moore in the United States Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, Civil Action File Number 1:23-CV-480.

The witness has signed a Declaration of Deponent which will be attached to the transcript as Exhibit A.

(DEPOSITION EXHIBIT

LETTER A WAS MARKED

FOR IDENTIFICATION)

THE COURT REPORTER: I'll ask the attorneys to please introduce yourselves and who you represent, and indicate for the record whether anyone else is present in the room with you.

MR. BOYLE: Good morning. My name is Ellis Boyle. I represent the Legislative Leader Defendants, Senator Berger and Speaker Moore. No one else is in the room with me. And I am joined by my co-counsel, Julia Payne and Denise Harle. I'll let



1     them say whether anyone is in the room with them. And  
2     my clients' lawyer, Joshua Yost, is also joining us.

3                 MS. PAYNE: This is Julia Payne with  
4     the Alliance Defending Freedom. No one is here with  
5     me. I'm in my office by myself.

6                 MS. HARLE: Denise Harle here. No one  
7     is joining me.

8                 MR. YOST: Joshua Yost, general counsel  
9     for Senator Berger, and no one else is in the room  
10    with me.

11                MS. GRANDIN: Good morning everyone.  
12    My name is Kara Grandin, counsel for Planned  
13    Parenthood South Atlantic. No one else is in the room  
14    with me. I am joined by co-counsel from Planned  
15    Parenthood Federation of America and the ACLU. I'll  
16    let them introduce themselves as well.

17                MS. SALVADOR: Hi. Anjali Salvador,  
18    also co-counsel for Planned Parenthood South Atlantic.  
19    No one is in the room for -- with me.

20                MR. BOYLE: You're on mute.

21                MS. SWANSON: Thanks. This is Hannah  
22    Swanson, also for Planned Parenthood South Atlantic,  
23    and no one is in the room with me.

24                MS. AMIRI: And this is Brigitte Amiri  
25    from the ACLU, representing Dr. Gray, and no one else

1 is in the room with me.

2 MR. MENDIAS: This is Ryan Mendias,  
3 also for Dr. Gray, also with the ACLU, and no one is  
4 in the room with me.

5 MR. MOORE: Hi. My name is South  
6 Moore. I'm at the North Carolina Department of  
7 Justice, and I'm representing Attorney General Josh  
8 Stein. No one else is in the room with me.

9 MS. MAFFETORE: Apologies, one more for  
10 Plaintiffs.

11 MR. MOORE: I'm sorry.

12 MS. MAFFETORE: My name is Jaclyn  
13 Maffetore. I'm with the ACLU of North Carolina. I  
14 represent all Plaintiffs in this matter, and nobody's  
15 in the room with me.

16 MR. BULLERI: I'm Michael Bulleri. I  
17 represent the North Carolina Medical Board, North  
18 Carolina Board of Nursing, and no one is in the room  
19 with me.

20 MR. WILLIAMS: Good morning everyone.  
21 My name is Kevin Williams, and I represent District  
22 Attorney Jim O'Neill, and no one is in the room with  
23 me.

24 MS. CROWLEY: Colleen Crowley, with the  
25 North Carolina Department of Justice, and I represent

1 DHHS, and no one is in the room with me.

2 MS. O'BRIEN: Good morning. I'm  
3 Elizabeth Curren O'Brien. I -- with North Carolina  
4 Department of Justice, and I represent the DA  
5 Defendants except for District Attorney O'Neill, who  
6 Kevin Williams represents.

7 THE COURT REPORTER: Okay. I believe  
8 that is everyone on my list. And since she has signed  
9 a Declaration of Deponent, we can begin.

10 MR. BOYLE: Very good.

11 THE WITNESS: I'm in the room by myself  
12 too. Just didn't want to get left out.

13 The witness, CHRISTY MARIE BORAAS ALSLEBEN,  
14 MD, under the penalty of perjury, testifies as  
15 follows:

16 EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. BOYLE:

18 Q. Very good. Good morning, Doctor. Have you  
19 ever been deposed before or given testimony under  
20 oath?

21 A. I have not.

22 Q. Okay. So obviously, we're doing this by  
23 Zoom so we're not sitting in a room. It's more formal  
24 than a normal conversation would be. There's a few  
25 ground rules I just want to run over with you.

1 A. Sure.

2 Q. You may have already heard this. If you  
3 have, I apologize for repeating it. First, the court  
4 reporter is going to be typing up and transcribing  
5 everything that we say. So it's important to make her  
6 job easier, two things.

7 One, that we try not to talk over each  
8 other. That can be a little tricky when you're in the  
9 Zoom context because there could be a delay. I think  
10 hopefully we'll get our sea legs as we go along and  
11 we'll try and see when one person's talking until they  
12 finish. And you're doing a great job so far.

13 And I may be guilty of this as well. So I  
14 apologize if we start stepping over each other with  
15 talking, I may politely try and redirect us. If I do  
16 that, please don't be offended. It's not meant to be  
17 offensive. Just trying to keep my court reporter  
18 happy. I always find that's a good thing.

19 A. Sure.

20 Q. Good. And then the second thing is nods and  
21 saying "uh-huh," those are perfectly normal in a  
22 normal conversation. Like I said, this is more  
23 formal. With transcriptions, if you nod your head up  
24 and down and you mean yes, that doesn't really  
25 translate well to the written transcript.

1           So as we go along, if I ask a question and I  
2     can tell what your answer is but you haven't said it  
3     out loud, I may prompt you. Again, if I do that, it's  
4     not intended to be rude at all. It's more for the  
5     formality and the court reporter. Is that okay?

6           A.     That sounds great.

7           Q.     Good. Doing a good job so far. Finally,  
8     there is an expectation that you will answer the  
9     questions asked even if there is an objection, absent  
10    some type of instruction from your lawyer, the lawyer  
11    representing you, to the contrary, okay?

12          A.     Yes.

13          Q.     Very good. Your medical specialty is in  
14    obstetrics -- I always say that wrong, obstetrics and  
15    gynecology. Is that correct?

16          A.     Yes. I completed an obstetrics and  
17    gynecology residency.

18          Q.     And the obstetrics part of the OB/GYN deals  
19    with pregnancy. Is that right?

20          A.     Yes.

21          Q.     Sometimes, you provide treatment and care to  
22    a pregnant woman as an obstetrician that leads to the  
23    birth of the pregnant woman's child. Is that right?

24          A.     Absolutely.

25          Q.     In that case, you would have provided

1     obstetrics care to the mother and child through the  
2     birth of the child. Is that right?

3           A.     We see -- yeah. I see pregnant people in  
4     clinic all the time and provide antenatal care up  
5     until the point of birth, yes.

6           Q.     And just -- I think I understood that, but  
7     just -- I'm a simple man. That means for the mother  
8     and the child up until the point of birth, right?

9           A.     For the mother and the fetus, yes.

10          Q.     And I -- I understand our terms may be a  
11     little bit different but ---

12          A.     Uh-huh (yes).

13          Q.     --- can we agree that, within reason, if we  
14     use a little bit different terms but we understand  
15     what each other's saying, we can just keep the  
16     conversation going with our own particular terms? Is  
17     that fair?

18          A.     Sounds fine to me.

19          Q.     Yeah. And I'm not asking you to adopt my  
20     terminology, and I think it's fine if you don't adopt  
21     mine. I think, typically, unborn child and fetus, I  
22     think we might be able to use interchangeably,  
23     understanding you may say fetus when I say unborn  
24     child. Is that fair?

25                   MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

1 MR. BOYLE: This is one of those ---

2 THE WITNESS: So I'm going to -- you  
3 know, as a medical expert in -- for this deposition,  
4 I'm going to stick to the medical terminology that's  
5 used in science. So I'm going to stick to that for my  
6 answers.

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Yes, and I'm not suggesting you  
8 shouldn't. I'm just saying, so we keep the flow, you  
9 understand what I'm saying and I understand what  
10 you're saying. Unless there's a question, in which  
11 case please stop me and ask me to clarify, okay?

12 A. Yeah. Certainly, if there's -- you know, if  
13 there's certain terminology that you're using that  
14 it's -- that is not clear to me, I'll be sure to ask.  
15 Thank you.

16 Q. Very good. After the child is born,  
17 typically the child's care shifts over to the  
18 pediatrician, and you stop seeing the child as your  
19 patient as an obstetrician. Is that fair?

20 A. That is, yeah, a good characteristic of my  
21 practice. We don't -- I don't see any newborns as a  
22 patient.

23 Q. Okay. An induced abortion involves some  
24 mechanism to terminate a pregnancy before the birth of  
25 what would otherwise appear to be a viable pregnancy

1 that would lead to the birth of a baby in the absence  
2 of the induced abortion. Is that correct?

3 A. So induced abortion is the procedure --  
4 using procedure or medicines to end the pregnancy  
5 without the intention of continuing the pregnancy and  
6 having -- and giving birth.

7 Q. And in the absence of an induced abortion,  
8 the expectation would be that it would be a viable  
9 pregnancy and eventually a child would be born?

10 A. Well, I mean, that's a lot of what, you  
11 know, patients and the lay public think, right? But  
12 there -- miscarriage happens in one-fifth of  
13 pregnancies, so I don't know that that's a completely  
14 accurate statement.

15 Q. Right. Miscarriage being an unplanned  
16 termination of the pregnancy. But absent a  
17 miscarriage, an induced abortion is meant to terminate  
18 a pregnancy that hasn't yet miscarried and,  
19 presumably, if it doesn't miscarry, would proceed all  
20 the way to the birth of the child?

21 A. I would say, you know, generally, that's  
22 true. However, there are certainly problems and  
23 chromosomal abnormalities. There are certainly  
24 pregnancies that continue and, for reasons that  
25 sometimes we know and sometimes we don't, you know,



1 end in a intrauterine fetal demise before birth.

2 Q. Fair enough. But not one that is  
3 intentionally induced by an abortion?

4 A. Not in that particular case, no.

5 Q. You perform surgical abortion for some  
6 pregnant women who are your patients, don't you?

7 A. Yes. I see pregnant people for procedural  
8 abortion.

9 Q. You perform chemical abortion for some  
10 pregnant women who are your patients, don't you?

11 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure what you ---

12 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. Go  
13 ahead. You can answer.

14 THE WITNESS: Sorry, Zoom. I'm not  
15 entirely sure what you mean by "chemical."

16 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Well, using chemicals or drugs  
17 to induce an abortion like -- well, I'm going to  
18 butcher these words, misoprotrol (sic) and Mifeprex,  
19 right?

20 A. So if you're -- you -- I think what you're  
21 talking about is using medicines, approved by the FDA  
22 for use in our country, to end a pregnancy in the  
23 first trimester, which would -- or second, depending  
24 on what the patient needs, to induce a -- for the  
25 mifepristone to block progesterone and the misoprostol

1 to cause cramping and bleeding so that the pregnancy  
2 will pass.

3 Q. Okay. And so I may refer to that as  
4 chemical abortion, but you may refer to it as medicine  
5 abortion. Is that sort of talking about the same  
6 thing, using those two drugs to induce an abortion?\

7 A. So the ---

8

9 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

10 THE WITNESS: The medical term for that  
11 is medication abortion.

12 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. And each of the women  
13 that you performed an induced abortion on was  
14 pregnant. Is that right?

15 A. For pregnant people that come to us, they've  
16 had confirmation of the pregnancy and then are  
17 requesting to end the pregnancy. And then we discuss  
18 options about how to do that.

19 Q. And I'm sorry, so is the answer yes, the  
20 people you performed an induced abortion on were  
21 pregnant when you did that procedure?

22 A. People who come requesting abortion have had  
23 confirmation of their pregnancy, yes, so they are  
24 pregnant.

25 Q. So every time that you performed an induced

1 abortion on a woman who was your pregnant -- I'm  
2 sorry, who -- a pregnant woman who was your patient,  
3 what was supposed to happen to the unborn child?

4 A. For people who make an appointment to  
5 discuss abortion care and then have counseling and go  
6 through informed consent and decide to proceed with  
7 either medication or procedural abortion, those people  
8 then have procedural termination of their pregnancy or  
9 termination of the pregnancy with medicines.

10 Q. And as an obstetrician, when you perform  
11 those induced abortions, do you consider the unborn  
12 child or the fetus to be your patient at that point?

13 A. I don't.

14 Q. How many induced abortions have you  
15 performed in your career?

16 A. I don't have an exact number to relay to the  
17 assembled audience here today. Many.

18 Q. Many like a hundred or many like a hundred  
19 thousand? Somewhere in between?

20 A. Somewhere between those two numbers, yes.

21 Q. Okay. Do you have an average per year that  
22 you -- of induced abortions that you perform?

23 A. I don't have an average per year, but maybe  
24 a week. I could provide probably numbers for weekly.  
25 An average week would be somewhere between five and

1 15. Sometimes, up to 20.

2 Q. Okay. So would you say an average week is  
3 ten to 12?

4 A. Sure.

5 Q. And is that 50 weeks a year?

6 A. I do take vacation occasionally, so yeah.

7 Q. So -- yeah, I mean ---

8 A. Forty -- 48 weeks a year.

9 Q. Forty. Okay, 40 weeks a year. Fair enough.  
10 Yeah.

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. I wasn't trying to make you work all the  
13 time.

14 A. Yeah. Okay. Thanks.

15 Q. So you're talking somewhere like 400 to 450  
16 a year would be a fair estimate?

17 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. You  
18 can answer.

19 THE WITNESS: Again, it's hard to give  
20 me -- give an exact number, but that's probably our  
21 best guess for today.

22 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And how many years have you  
23 been in this practice that that would be your typical  
24 practice?

25 A. I have been an attending physician since

1 2014.

2 Q. So nine, coming on ten years. Is that  
3 right?

4 A. Yes. But please don't age me so fast.

5 Q. You're far younger than me, so hopefully you  
6 won't catch up. The -- that sounded like -- that came  
7 out wrong. I apologize. You're going to get older.  
8 It's too bad.

9 The -- and in residency, were you doing the  
10 same rough numbers of induced abortions per year?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Would you have been doing more or less  
13 during residency?

14 A. Less during residency because I was  
15 learning, you know, many other aspects of obstetrics  
16 and gynecology at that time as well.

17 Q. How about during your two-year fellowship  
18 for advanced family planning?

19 A. Yeah. So my fellowship, which you are  
20 entirely correct was two years, was focused on  
21 contraception for complex -- people with complex  
22 medical conditions and clinical research, and also  
23 focused care for induced abortion and abnormal  
24 pregnancy as well as pregnancy of unknown location.

25 Q. Have you ever performed a chemical or

1 medicine abortion on a patient who was pregnant with  
2 twins?

3 A. Yes. Yeah, I have seen a pregnant person  
4 that requested a medication abortion in the first  
5 trimester.

6 Q. And they were pregnant with twins?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. Does that change the mechanism or the  
9 process that you go through when you're performing a  
10 chemical or medicine abortion with a patient who is  
11 pregnant with twins?

12 A. Our process for when a patient makes an  
13 appointment with us to consider medication abortion is  
14 pretty similar regardless of the characteristics of  
15 the pregnancy.

16 So our process is to, you know, provide  
17 thorough informed consent, to use our extensive  
18 protocols about coercion and to ensure that people are  
19 making their best decisions for themselves, and then  
20 describe in detail expectations about what to expect  
21 with medication abortion and what signs and symptoms  
22 might prompt further follow-up.

23 Q. Does the fact that a patient is pregnant  
24 with twins change the actual amounts of medication or  
25 chemicals given to induce the abortion for that

1 patient?

2 A. No. The medicines are the same.

3 Q. Would that be true of a patient with  
4 triplets or quadruplets or more also?

5 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

6 THE WITNESS: I have never provided a  
7 medication abortion for a patient that had triplets or  
8 a higher-order multiple gestation.

9 Q. (Mr. Boyle) How do you know that?

10 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

11 THE WITNESS: I have never done that to  
12 the -- to my knowledge.

13 Q. (Mr. Boyle) How would you know if a  
14 pregnant patient of yours is pregnant with twins or  
15 triplets or quadruplets?

16 A. Typically, we would know that from  
17 ultrasound.

18 Q. Are there any greater risks involved with a  
19 patient who is pregnant with twins or triplets or  
20 quadruplets getting a chemical or medical abortion?

21 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

22 THE WITNESS: I can really only speak  
23 to patients that I've seen that have had a twin  
24 gestation. And the answer to that part of the  
25 question is no.

1 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Have you seen any studies that  
2 describe that or talk about that?

3 A. I don't recall seeing any studies  
4 specifically discussing higher-order multiples and  
5 medication abortion.

6 Q. So you have your experience but you don't  
7 have any additional scientific literature or studies  
8 to support the question of whether there is a higher  
9 risk for a pregnant patient who has twins or triplets  
10 receiving a medical -- I'm sorry, medicine or chemical  
11 abortion. Is that correct?

12 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

13 THE WITNESS: The risk for a person  
14 with a singleton gestation would be the -- similar to  
15 the risks of a person that has a twin gestation.

16 Q. (Mr. Boyle) But you don't have any studies  
17 to support that conclusion, do you?

18 A. At the ready, no. But I certainly could do  
19 an extensive literature search about that and get back  
20 to you about that.

21 Q. Is there any way to tell if a patient is  
22 pregnant with twins or triplets or quadruplets other  
23 than by taking a transvaginal ultrasound of that  
24 patient?

25 A. Transvaginal ultrasonography is not required



1 for diagnosing a multiple gestation.

2 Q. You can do it without an ultrasound?

3 A. You don't need a transvaginal one.

4 Q. Okay. You can -- oh, that's fair.

5 Ultrasound is the way that you tell if your pregnant  
6 patient has twins or triplets or quadruplets, right?

7 A. That would be -- that would be -- yes, that  
8 -- it would be -- ultrasound is the typical way we  
9 diagnose a multiple gestation, yes.

10 Q. Do you think it's important to know if a  
11 pregnant patient that you're providing an induced  
12 abortion to has twins or triplets or quadruplets  
13 before you provide that induced abortion?

14 A. I think, given the rarity of spontaneous  
15 triplets and certainly higher-order multiple  
16 gestations for pregnant people in our country, that  
17 that would be an irrational thing to require for each  
18 person coming to access medication abortion.

19 Q. I'm sorry, you said "an irrational thing."  
20 What thing are you talking about?

21 A. Like, an irrational thing to require an  
22 ultrasound to ensure that you know whether or not a  
23 person has a singleton gestation, which is the vast  
24 majority of pregnant people, or a twin gestation,  
25 which is a very low amount of people, versus a

1 higher-order multiple gestation like triplets or  
2 quadruplets or quints or something crazy, which is  
3 even -- which is just even more rare. It's irrational  
4 to require transvaginal ultrasonography when safety  
5 isn't known to be improved for that.

6 Q. Well, you said safety isn't known to be  
7 improved but you also, I believe, said that you're not  
8 aware of any studies of the risks in -- associated  
9 with induced abortions for twins or triplets or  
10 quadruplets. Did I misstate that?

11 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

12 THE WITNESS: What I -- what I want to  
13 communicate to this group is that the risks of  
14 medication abortion for somebody with a singleton  
15 gestation or a twin gestation are the same.

16 I don't know of any other studies for --  
17 again, at the top of my head, because -- because the  
18 incidence of triplets, quadruplets, quints is so  
19 exceedingly rare that there wouldn't -- I would not be  
20 surprised if there aren't studies about that because  
21 it is so rare.

22 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Is there any increased risk for  
23 performing a surgical abortion on a patient who is  
24 pregnant with twins or triplets or quadruplets?

25 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

1 THE WITNESS: In the first trimester,  
2 no.

3 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Have you seen any studies that  
4 support your opinion on that?

5 A. Not that I recall at this moment.

6 Q. So you're unaware of any independent  
7 corroborating scientific literature to support that  
8 opinion, but that's your opinion. Is that what you're  
9 saying?

10 A. Again, it's really hard -- with the vast  
11 amount of literature on this topic, it's really hard  
12 to keep all of that in my brain at one time. But I  
13 certainly am well versed at extensive literature  
14 searches and could produce that if you -- if need be.

15 Q. Well ---

16 A. If it exists.

17 Q. Sorry.

18 A. Sorry.

19 Q. No, please finish if you had something else.

20 A. Yeah, so, I mean, it's not uncommon that as  
21 a physician, right, if I have a clinical question,  
22 that I would go to the literature and look things up  
23 and to really examine that.

24 I can tell you that, in my practice, the  
25 risk for a procedural abortion in the first trimester,

1 whether a patient has a singleton IUP or a twin  
2 gestation, those two people would have similar risks.

3 Q. And is that also true for second-trimester  
4 procedural abortions?

5 A. Second-trimester procedural abortions have  
6 similar risks to the first. However, when -- it  
7 really just kind of depends on what the gestation is.  
8 We would certainly, in the second trimester, you know,  
9 be prepared for all the risks associated with the  
10 procedure.

11 Q. Have you looked at any documents or  
12 guidelines from the Plaintiff, Planned Parenthood  
13 South Atlantic, in this case?

14 A. I have reviewed the declarations from  
15 Dr. Farris.

16 Q. Have you looked at any independent documents  
17 beyond what Dr. Farris said in her declarations from  
18 Planned Parenthood South Atlantic?

19 A. No.

20 Q. So you're not basing any of your opinions on  
21 the actual guidelines or protocols from Planned  
22 Parenthood South Atlantic, are you?

23 A. I'm not employed by Planned Parenthood South  
24 Atlantic, so I don't know their specific protocols.  
25 What I do know is that Planned Parenthood Federation

1 of America convenes expert medical -- medically  
2 trained people, advanced practice clinicians,  
3 physicians, certified nurse midwives to review  
4 evidence related to all aspects of care that we  
5 provide at all affiliates, and there are standards  
6 related to those.

7 Q. So this is information that is shared  
8 nationwide among Planned Parenthood subsidiaries. Is  
9 that what you're saying?

10 A. Yeah. There's what -- there's a national  
11 group of medical experts that convenes and reviews  
12 evidence and ensures that we have the most up-to-date,  
13 evidence-based protocols to use in our health centers.

14 Q. But none of your opinions in this case are  
15 based on Planned Parenthood South Atlantic's internal  
16 guides or protocols, because you haven't seen any of  
17 those, correct?

18 A. I have not seen them with my eyeballs, but I  
19 suspect they are very similar to the ones we use here  
20 at Planned Parenthood North Central States.

21 Q. Did you read the laws at issue in this case  
22 in the process of developing your opinions?

23 A. I review -- I've read portions of them.

24 Q. Which portions did you read?

25 A. I mean, I can't -- I don't recall the

1 specifics, but I read the -- I read details related to  
2 both the hospitalization requirement and the portion  
3 that requires existence of -- documentation of the  
4 existence of an intrauterine pregnancy.

5 Q. And how did you know to just read those two  
6 excerpts from the laws?

7 A. In conversations with counsel, we reviewed  
8 those two specific themes and the portions of the law  
9 that pertain to them.

10 Q. So as part of your conversations with the  
11 Plaintiff's lawyers, you were given just specific  
12 excerpts of the laws, not the whole law themselves?

13 MS. GRANDIN: Objection. Calls for  
14 privileged information. You can answer to the extent  
15 you don't disclose any privileged communications.

16 THE WITNESS: We -- I'm sorry, can you  
17 repeat the question?

18 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Yeah. So you were talking  
19 about your conversations with counsel. And I was just  
20 asking specifically the conversations you had with the  
21 Plaintiff's counsel involved just them feeding you the  
22 specific excerpts, not the whole law, so you haven't  
23 read the whole law to base your opinion. Is that  
24 correct?

25 MS. GRANDIN: Same objection.

1 THE WITNESS: I am perfectly capable of  
2 scrolling and reading a PDF myself. And I'm also a  
3 very busy practicing clinician, and so I focused on  
4 the portions of the law that I was planning to provide  
5 expert testimony for.

6 Q. (Mr. Boyle) When were you first contacted  
7 by Plaintiffs to be their expert witness in this case?

8 A. In late July.

9 Q. Did you have -- well, I guess you didn't  
10 have anything to do with the temporary restraining  
11 order portion of the case leading up to July 1st. Is  
12 that correct?

13 A. That is correct.

14 Q. Okay. Do you agree that patient safety is  
15 always the most important consideration when you're  
16 treating a patient?

17 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

18 THE WITNESS: Patient safety is  
19 absolutely near the top, yes.

20 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you always choose to treat  
21 your patients in the safest way?

22 A. I aim to.

23 Q. So as I understand it, you work for another  
24 affiliate of the Planned Parenthood Federation of  
25 America. Is that correct?

1           A.    Yeah.  So I'm employed by the University of  
2   Minnesota Medical School.  I'm an associate professor  
3   in obstetrics and gynecology there.  I'm also a board  
4   -- board certified in obstetrics and gynecology.

5                I'm also sub -- board certified in the  
6   subspecialty of complex family planning and I provide  
7   care at Planned Parenthood North Central States, as  
8   you just described.

9           Q.    And so Planned Parenthood North Central  
10   States is like a branch -- subsidiary branch of  
11   Planned Parenthood Federation of America just like  
12   Planned Parenthood South Atlantic is a branch here in  
13   North Carolina.  Is that fair?

14          A.    Planned Parenthood North Central States is  
15   an affiliate, yeah.  We -- that's how they are  
16   described.  Uh-huh (yes).  So there's over -- you  
17   know, sort of guiding principles and, like I said,  
18   medical standards, but each affiliate is responsible  
19   for, you know, the conduct of their -- of the  
20   healthcare provided within their health centers.

21          Q.    And Dr. Farris is the director who runs the  
22   South -- Planned Parenthood South Atlantic.  And  
23   you're the director and you run the Planned Parenthood  
24   Central North States, right?

25          A.    I'm the director of research at Planned



1 Parenthood North Central States and I also serve as  
2 one of the associate medical directors. I am not the  
3 chief medical officer of Planned Parenthood North  
4 Central States.

5 Q. Do you know Dr. Farris personally?

6 A. I don't.

7 Q. Never met her at any Planned Parenthood  
8 convention or seminar or anything like that?

9 A. I have never met her directly.

10 Q. Excluding the lawyers who represent the  
11 Plaintiffs in this case, have you spoken to anyone  
12 else, to include other doctors perhaps, about your  
13 opinions in this case?

14 A. No. I mean, my husband knows I'm here, but  
15 he -- he's not medical and he wouldn't know anything I  
16 was speaking about if I tried to tell him.

17 Q. So you said you looked at Senate Bill 20 in  
18 the process of developing your opinions. Did you see  
19 where it defines possible complications that can arise  
20 from an induced abortion at North Carolina General  
21 Statue Section 90-21.81(2)a?

22 A. I mean, I'd have to see the text again to  
23 say whether or not I reviewed that portion.

24 Q. Okay. What is a uterine perforation?

25 A. A uterine perforation is a known risk of

1 procedural abortion when an instrument goes into the  
2 wall or through the wall of the uterus during the  
3 procedure.

4 Q. When you say "instrument," what do you mean  
5 by instrument?

6 A. A surgical instrument, either a suction  
7 cannula or a forceps, typically.

8 Q. And how does that happen during a procedural  
9 -- I'm sorry, surgical abortion?

10 A. How that happens, you know, really just  
11 depends on the -- on the case. It is a very low risk.  
12 It's a very -- it's a -- it's a known complication and  
13 one that I counsel patients about, but it is not very  
14 common.

15 Q. Do you agree that this is a possible  
16 complication that can arise from an induced abortion,  
17 surgical abortion, that should be disclosed to a  
18 pregnant woman who is a patient considering that type  
19 of abortion so that the patient can make an informed  
20 decision with more complete knowledge of the risks of  
21 the procedure?

22 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

23 THE WITNESS: I believe all people  
24 should -- that are pregnant and considering abortion  
25 should be counseled on the risks and benefits of the

1 desired mode of abortion that they are considering.

2 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And who should inform the  
3 patient of that potential risk?

4 A. I mean, our whole healthcare team takes onus  
5 of that. But ultimately, it's my responsibility as  
6 the treating physician to ensure that the patient has  
7 good informed consent about the procedure that they  
8 have selected.

9 Q. And how -- I'm sorry, when should that  
10 patient be informed of this particular risk?

11 A. Prior to their procedural abortion.

12 Q. Are you aware that in -- under the North  
13 Carolina law, there's a 72-hour informed consent  
14 period where, after the initial counseling, the  
15 patient has to wait 72 hours before the induced  
16 abortion can occur?

17 A. I was not -- I'm -- I was not aware of that  
18 mandatory counseling wait, but that is a common thing  
19 that -- law that some patient -- some states have  
20 enacted accepting and exceptionalizing the healthcare  
21 that we provide during abortion care.

22 Q. What is a cervical laceration?

23 A. A cervical laceration is a tear that -- in  
24 the cervix.

25 Q. And how -- well, do you agree that a

1 cervical laceration is a possible complication that  
2 can arise from an induced abortion?

3 A. Yes. Mostly for -- mostly, we consider that  
4 risk for procedural abortion, and mostly in the second  
5 trimester.

6 Q. And how can that happen during a surgical  
7 abortion?

8 A. Again, the specifics of how those occur are  
9 unique to each case. And the overall risk of cervical  
10 lacerations at the time of procedural abortion is also  
11 very low.

12 Q. Well, how is it even possible that a  
13 cervical laceration could occur during a surgical  
14 abortion?

15 A. How it might occur would be related to  
16 during the evacuation part of the procedure, as the --  
17 there are -- as the -- as we're guiding the fetus out  
18 through the cervix.

19 Q. So explain to me what you mean by that. How  
20 do you guide the fetus out through the cervix?

21 A. With instruments.

22 Q. What type of instruments?

23 A. It's -- it varies for each case. Typically,  
24 a combination, again, of suction and forceps.

25 Q. So forceps are, not to be indelicate, but

1 sort of like tongs like you would see in a kitchen?

2 Is that what forceps ---

3 A. They do not look like ---

4 Q. A medical version?

5 A. They don't look like grilling tongs, no.

6 Q. What do they look like then?

7 A. I don't know. It's hard to -- really to  
8 describe that in words for a person who's -- I would  
9 guess never has seen one. I'd certainly be able to  
10 find an image for you if that would be helpful.

11 Q. Are they sharp?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Are they -- do they have rounded edges?

14 A. They do.

15 Q. How does something that's not sharp cause a  
16 laceration?

17 A. Mostly, that occurs because the cervix  
18 probably suboptimally responded to the preparation of  
19 the cervix that's typically employed, especially in  
20 the second trimester.

21 Q. So when we're talking second trimester, what  
22 weeks are we actually talking about?

23 A. The medical community, medical consensus  
24 about when the second trimester starts is at 14 weeks  
25 and zero days and continues until 27 weeks and six

1 days.

2 Q. And am I correct in understanding that that  
3 14 weeks actually includes an extra two weeks for  
4 implantation?

5 A. Again, the medical community uses and dates  
6 a pregnancy starting with the first day of the last  
7 menstrual period.

8 Q. Okay. And how big is the baby or the fetus  
9 at 14 weeks when the second trimester starts?

10 A. It varies depending on the patient.

11 Q. What's the typical size?

12 A. I don't -- I don't know that there is a  
13 typical size.

14 Q. What's the expected range that you as a  
15 practicing OB/GYN, who has done this for at least nine  
16 years, expect to see?

17 A. Yeah. There are certain -- you know, there  
18 are certain calibrated measurements that we use with  
19 ultrasound that can give an estimated size, but that's  
20 a conglomeration of different measurements that --  
21 that gives an estimated gestational age if someone  
22 doesn't have one already.

23 Q. And would that be head-to-rump measurements?  
24 Is that what it's called?

25 A. Not typically at 14 weeks. Typically at 14

1 weeks, we would use the biparietal diameter.

2 Q. What's that?

3 A. That's a measurement that can be performed  
4 with ultrasound that measures the biparietal diameter,  
5 the distance.

6 Q. Okay. When you say that, "biparietal  
7 diameter," what ---

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. --- exactly is that?

10 A. It's the distance between the parietal  
11 bones.

12 Q. Where is that?

13 A. In the cranium.

14 Q. So it's the skull?

15 A. Colloquially, yes, skull.

16 Q. Which bones in the cranium or the skull is  
17 it that you're measuring there?

18 A. I'm sorry, what?

19 Q. Which part of the cranium or the skull are  
20 you measuring with the biperimetal (sic) diameter?

21 A. It's biparietal diameter. And again, it's  
22 the distance between both parietal bones. Yeah.

23 Q. What are the parietal bones in the skull?

24 A. They're bones of the skull.

25 Q. Well, I got a head and I can point to it.

1 Can you -- can you point to your head where the  
2 parietal bones are in the skull?

3 A. Well, I -- you know, again, for the sake of  
4 the transcript, I don't think that would be reflected  
5 very well. But I think, you know, the parietal bones  
6 on the side of -- both sides of the skull.

7 Q. Okay. So sort of right above the ears on an  
8 adult would be where the parietal bones are. Is that  
9 correct?

10 A. I don't know that I've ever measured a  
11 biparietal diameter on an adult. But, yes, on the  
12 fetus, that's where we measure them.

13 Q. Okay. So not the top, not the bottom. On  
14 the sides. Not the face, not the back of the head.  
15 Sort of above where the ears will eventually be if  
16 they're not already there, that's what you're  
17 measuring. Is that correct?

18 A. We measure, again, the distance between both  
19 visualized parietal bones on ultrasound. Kind of at  
20 the level of the thalamus, if you want to be more  
21 specific, so that's typically well above of the ears.

22 Q. So explain to me again what that measurement  
23 tells you and why it's important to guide your  
24 decision-making as the doctor who is performing the  
25 D&E abortion.



1 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

2 THE WITNESS: The biparietal diameter  
3 in the early -- you know, in the second trimester, if  
4 one were using one single measurement for dating a  
5 pregnancy, is the best one for dating, providing a  
6 gestational age for the pregnancy if, again, a person  
7 doesn't have -- has not had an ultrasound previously.

8 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And why is that measurement  
9 important to inform you as the doctor about what types  
10 of tools you -- as I understand, you said that's the  
11 driving factor for what type of tools you use.

12 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

13 THE WITNESS: Gestational age is a  
14 consideration sort of preoperatively about what my  
15 initial plan would be for how to accomplish a  
16 procedural abortion safely.

17 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Why? What exactly does it tell  
18 you? How does it inform your decision-making?

19 A. Because it -- because the size of the fetus  
20 is related to how we're able to accomplish the  
21 procedure.

22 Q. In what way does the size of the fetus or  
23 the baby impact your decision-making on how you  
24 accomplish the procedure?

25 A. Yeah. It dictates a lot of what instruments

1 we use, what kind of preparation of the cervix might  
2 be the safest and recommended for increased safety to  
3 decrease the risks of both perforation and cervical  
4 laceration like we've already discussed.

5 Q. So again, I'm still having trouble  
6 understanding how the forceps, which are rounded and  
7 not sharp cause a laceration in the cervix. Can you  
8 explain that to me, please?

9 A. Again, it -- it really just depends on the  
10 case. As the fetus comes through the cervix, there  
11 can be mismatch in size. There can be, as you know --  
12 ossification of certain parts of the fetus can cause  
13 tears in the cervix also.

14 Q. When you say "ossification of certain parts  
15 of the fetus," are you saying that the fetus, the baby  
16 has developed bones that are hard which could be sharp  
17 and cause a cut?

18 A. The fetus ---

19 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

20 THE WITNESS: The fetus certainly  
21 develops bones as it grows, yes.

22 Q. (Mr. Boyle) At what stage does the baby,  
23 the fetus, start to develop ossification or bones that  
24 could be hard enough that they could cause a cervical  
25 laceration?

1           A.    I mean, we're -- to be honest, the --  
2    laceration is something we always worry about, much  
3    more so in the second trimester. And again, the  
4    overall risk of that complication is extremely low.  
5    When it occurs, you know, we identify and treat it.

6                   And when -- there's not a specific point in  
7    pregnancy where -- that I can, you know, define a week  
8    for you where that risk becomes exceedingly more high.  
9    Because it just -- it's always very low.

10           Q.    Well, at week ten, you're doing an  
11    aspiration abortion, not a D&E abortion, right?

12           A.    So -- I'm sorry, can -- will you repeat the  
13    question? I don't think I got it, the whole thing.

14           Q.    At week ten -- and when I say "week," are we  
15    talking about gestational age, or is that a different  
16    thing? Are you saying gestational age when you say  
17    week?

18           A.    Yeah. So if I -- if I say a pregnancy is  
19    ten weeks, that's -- I consider that the gestational  
20    age.

21           Q.    Okay. So at ---

22           A.    Calculated from the last menstrual period.  
23    Sorry to speak over.

24           Q.    It's fine. I understand. So at week ten,  
25    gestational age, typically the baby or the fetus has

1 not developed any bones in its growth process. Is  
2 that correct?

3 A. Not necessarily. Organogenesis is --  
4 begins, you know, sometime between the eighth and 12th  
5 week of pregnancy.

6 Q. Okay. So at week eight, you would say  
7 there's not likely going to be any bones or  
8 ossification in that baby/fetus. Is that correct?

9 A. I mean, it kind of depends. Certainly --  
10 you know, certainly, it -- I don't -- I don't consider  
11 bones, you know, in the -- when I'm counseling a  
12 person about procedural abortion or continuing a  
13 pregnancy, for that matter, at eight weeks.

14 Q. Because you don't think that the baby or the  
15 fetus has developed bones in eight weeks. Is that  
16 correct?

17 A. No. Not necessarily. It's just when we --  
18 you know, we're good at magnifying things with  
19 ultrasound quite a bit. At the end of an eight-week  
20 procedural abortion, there certainly wouldn't be  
21 identifiable bones for me to see with my -- with my  
22 eyes.

23 Q. But that would be different at the end of a  
24 14-week ---

25 A. Potentially, yes.

1 Q. --- procedural abortion? Okay.

2 A. Uh-huh (yes).

3 Q. So walk me through what happens when you do  
4 an aspiration abortion versus a D&E abortion. What's  
5 the difference between those two? And please explain  
6 the difference by explaining what each one of them is.

7 A. Sure. A procedural abortion that involves  
8 aspiration alone would include dilation of the cervix  
9 and then evacuation of the pregnancy typically with  
10 suction alone.

11 Q. So I'm looking for a little bit more in  
12 depth. What does that actually mean when you say  
13 "suction alone"? What device do you use? How is it  
14 placed? What is it doing when it's placed? What  
15 happens afterwards?

16 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

17 THE WITNESS: Yeah, that's kind of a  
18 lot of questions in a row, so I'm going to try to get  
19 them all. If I don't, please let me know.

20 So after dilation of the cervix, we pass a  
21 cannula, typically plastic. I've only ever used  
22 plastic ones in my professional career. And then the  
23 plastic cannula's attached to either handheld, so  
24 manual vacuum aspiration, or electric vacuum  
25 aspiration, you know, generated with a motor.

1 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So the plastic aspiration tube,  
2 what does that look like?

3 A. It looks like a plastic tube. It's  
4 typically clear.

5 Q. How big is the diameter?

6 A. So we -- cannulas are sized in diameter and  
7 measured in millimeters.

8 Q. So what is the size and measurement?

9 A. There are many different sizes of cannulas.

10 Q. So you have an array of options to choose  
11 from when you decide to do an aspiration abortion. Is  
12 that correct?

13 A. That is correct.

14 Q. How do you determine what size to use in a  
15 particular patient?

16 A. Yes. Typically, we have a prior plan, so a  
17 plan at -- you know, just prior to the start of the  
18 procedure of what cannula we're going to use to  
19 accomplish the abortion safely.

20 Q. And what is it that drives your planning on  
21 that? How do you make that plan?

22 A. Typically, the gestational age of the  
23 pregnancy.

24 Q. What does that impact? How does that impact  
25 your decision-making on what size of the cannula?

1           A.     Because, in my experience, when we use an  
2     eight-millimeter cannula, for example, an eight-week  
3     pregnancy will pass through the cannula successfully.

4           Q.     Okay. So when you say eight millimeters,  
5     that's the top-to-bottom diameter of the inside of the  
6     tube. Is that correct?

7           A.     It's the -- it's diameter of the -- of the  
8     suction cannula, yes.

9           Q.     And is it just a tube with a flush end  
10    opening that is placed and does the suction?

11          A.     Yeah, so the suction cannula is attached  
12    either to a manual vacuum aspirator, which I don't  
13    have here in my office but I certainly could get one  
14    to show you, or electric suction via tubing.

15          Q.     Okay. And if it's the manual version of  
16    suction, who is it that's actually manipulating that  
17    machine to create the suction?

18          A.     The operating -- the operating healthcare  
19    provider.

20          Q.     So the doctor, or a technician?

21          A.     In our setting, a doctor.

22          Q.     Okay. So if you're doing a manual  
23    aspiration abortion, you're the one actually turning  
24    the crank to create the suction on it?

25          A.     It's not a -- it's not a crank. It's --

1 looks similar to maybe a large syringe. So there's a  
2 plunger, right, that once you create the seal at the  
3 top of the device, you pull back the plunger to  
4 create, you know, vacuum in the -- in the -- in the  
5 canister, in the -- you know, again, if you're a  
6 -- you know, thinking of it as akin to a syringe,  
7 right, you would pull back and then -- it's similar to  
8 that.

9 Q. Okay. And then the fetus is pulled through  
10 the cannula tube into that reservoir there that you're  
11 pulling the plunger back from. Is that correct?

12 A. Yeah. The pregnancy -- we evacuate the  
13 pregnancy into the -- into the canister.

14 Q. And does that also include the placenta and  
15 the other parts of the embryonic sac, et cetera, that  
16 is removed with the syringe or the plunger?

17 A. Yeah. So what comes into the canister --  
18 and this would be for an induced abortion or for a  
19 missed abortion or what people would talk about -- you  
20 know, what people would call a miscarriage. We -- we  
21 evacuate all the tissue that's inside the uterus.

22 Typically, in the eighth week of pregnancy,  
23 for example, we don't talk about the tissue being  
24 placenta. It's really the -- the gestational sac and  
25 the villi. And again, in early pregnancy, there's



1 usually not an identifiable fetus. So it really just  
2 depends.

3 Q. At what point do you ---

4 A. Oh, sorry, may ---

5 Q. Go ahead.

6 A. --- can I go back ---

7 Q. Yeah.

8 A. --- for just a second? We also evacuate the  
9 decidual tissue, which is tissue that forms in the  
10 uterus, supporting tissue around the pregnancy.

11 Q. And do you do all of that, if it's manual,  
12 with just one pull, one time pulling back the plunger  
13 from the syringe device?

14 A. Many times, yes. Again, it really -- it  
15 really just depends. Our goal with any aspiration  
16 procedure is to ensure the uterus is empty at the end.

17 Q. So what do you do with the contents of that  
18 plunger when you're doing the manual aspiration  
19 abortion after you're completed with the procedure?

20 A. We examine the tissue to ensure we have the  
21 amount of tissue that we're expecting based on the  
22 gestational age of the pregnancy. And then there are  
23 laws governing the handling of pregnancy tissue in all  
24 states including Minnesota.

25 Q. Is that tissue used for any scientific

1 research or anything like that?

2 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

3 THE WITNESS: In our setting, whether  
4 I'm providing abortion care at the University of  
5 Minnesota or at Planned Parenthood North Central  
6 States, we currently don't have that option for  
7 patients at this time.

8 Q. (Mr. Boyle) How is the material then  
9 treated? What is done with it then?

10 A. Yeah, we follow the laws in Minnesota  
11 regarding the disposal of pregnancy tissue.

12 Q. And what ---

13 A. And all tissue actually, whether or not I  
14 take -- you know, do a biopsy of the vulva or, you  
15 know, culture, exudate from a wound or something like  
16 that.

17 Q. What exactly does the law in Minnesota  
18 require you to do with that?

19 MS. GRANDIN: Objection. Calls for a  
20 legal conclusion.

21 THE WITNESS: The laws in Minnesota  
22 require that in -- well, I have -- most detailed  
23 knowledge about what -- you know, to be honest, at the  
24 University of Minnesota, pathology is the department  
25 that handles that. But here at Planned Parenthood

1 North Central States, we contract with a mortuary  
2 provider.

3 And we also offer the patients the option to  
4 make their own arrangements for handling of the fetal  
5 tissue after the procedure if that's their desire.

6 MR. BOYLE: Okay. I've got us at 58  
7 minutes and I'd just as soon take a break if that's  
8 all right with everyone else. Is everyone okay with  
9 that?

10 MS. GRANDIN: Uh-huh (yes). Does ten  
11 minutes sound good?

12 MR. BOYLE: Ten minutes is fine.

13 THE COURT REPORTER: Off the record at  
14 11:09 a.m.

15 (Brief recess: 11:09 a.m. to 11:20 a.m.)

16 THE COURT REPORTER: Back on the record  
17 at 11:20 a.m.

18 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. Doctor, we were talking  
19 about the differences between aspiration abortion and  
20 D&E abortion. At what point does the fetus or the  
21 baby get to the size where you need to switch from  
22 doing an aspiration abortion to a D&E abortion?

23 A. In my practice, typically, that's around the  
24 17th week.

25 Q. Okay. And so you said you use an

1 eight-millimeter cannula to do the suction with an  
2 aspiration abortion at an eight-week gestational age.  
3 What size cannula are you using at week 16 before you  
4 decide to switch to a D&E in week 17?

5 A. Yeah, typically, at 16 weeks, I would --  
6 again, it kind of depends on the patient-specific  
7 characteristics, but generally I would try to start  
8 with a 16-millimeter cannula.

9 Q. Is it just a roughly number of weeks to  
10 number of millimeters decision?

11 A. That's a -- yeah, that's a general  
12 guideline.

13 Q. And again, going back to doing an aspiration  
14 abortion for twins or -- or triplets, do you need to  
15 know whether there are twins or triplets before you  
16 start that procedure?

17 A. To increase safety, no.

18 Q. Do you need to know for any reason?

19 A. Well, I think it's important -- you know,  
20 it's our standard practice to ask people, if they're  
21 having an ultrasound and the person who is pregnant,  
22 if they want to know whether or not they have a  
23 multiple gestation or not.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. It's -- I mean, it's their body, so I think

1 that's important, you know, for -- piece of  
2 information to know whether or not the person who's  
3 pregnant wants to know that information.

4 Q. Is it important to the doctor performing the  
5 induced abortion?

6 A. Again, to increase safety, not really. It's  
7 my standard practice to use ultrasound during the  
8 procedure in the -- in the case of a multiple  
9 gestation.

10 Q. So when you've performed aspiration  
11 abortions, and I think you said you've only done it  
12 with twins, on a patient who's pregnant with twins,  
13 you use ultrasound during that procedure. Is that  
14 correct?

15 A. That -- yeah. I mean, generally speaking,  
16 yes, that is my -- the general way I do those  
17 procedures.

18 Q. Why?

19 A. Well, one of the ways, right, we know that  
20 the procedure is complete is how the uterus feels at  
21 the end, right? It feels empty. The other way we  
22 know the procedure is complete is by examining the  
23 products of conception after the procedure.

24 So, for example, if the patient has a  
25 six-week twin-gestation pregnancy, identifying the

1 pregnancy tissue at the end of the procedure and  
2 knowing for sure that a -- that we have both  
3 gestational sac -- gestational sacs present is a  
4 little bit harder, technically, to do.

5 And so in order to both ensure -- to ensure  
6 the uterus is empty at the completion of the  
7 procedure, I use ultrasound guidance.

8 Q. And so for that pregnant woman who is  
9 pregnant with twins that you do an aspiration abortion  
10 for at six weeks, you use an ultrasound during the  
11 actual procedure, during the aspiration abortion. Is  
12 that correct?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. And how is it that you've come to know that  
15 that particular patient was pregnant with twins before  
16 you started that procedure?

17 A. Prior to procedural abortion, it's our  
18 practice to -- to review ultrasound records that the  
19 patient brings with them, for example, or to provide  
20 an ultrasound in our -- in our health center prior to  
21 procedural abortion.

22 Q. So when you are performing -- and when you  
23 say that, at your center, are you talking about at the  
24 hospital, or are you talking about at the Planned  
25 Parenthood clinic where you work?

1 A. In both settings, that would be true.

2 Q. So at both the hospital and at the Planned  
3 Parenthood clinic, before you do a procedural  
4 abortion, an aspiration abortion or a D&E abortion,  
5 you perform an ultrasound on those patients a hundred  
6 percent of the time. Is that correct?

7 A. I mean, as a experienced healthcare  
8 provider, I try not to say ever a hundred percent,  
9 because that's just not always possible. But, yes, it  
10 is -- it is our general practice to review records of  
11 an ultrasound previously or to provide one on the day  
12 -- or to provide one for a patient prior to a  
13 procedural abortion.

14 Q. And in your memory, have you actually  
15 performed an aspiration abortion on a woman who was  
16 pregnant with twins at six weeks gestational age?

17 A. I mean, the specifics at six weeks, I  
18 couldn't say for sure at six versus seven. But I  
19 certainly have provided a procedural abortion for a  
20 patient who had a twin gestation in the first  
21 trimester. That statement would certainly be  
22 accurate.

23 Q. Okay. We've talked about aspiration  
24 abortion. And if you would now, please explain what  
25 the details are of the D&E abortion, please.

1 A. "The details" meaning what?

2 Q. How do you do it?

3 A. Yeah. How we do it, again, depending on  
4 where somebody is in their -- in their pregnancy, they  
5 -- we may recommend some type of preparation of the  
6 cervix.

7 We know from data and guidelines from the  
8 Society of Family Planning, for example, that cervical  
9 preparation helps reduce the risk of the -- of a D&E  
10 procedure, especially in the -- later in the second  
11 trimester when we're providing that care.

12 Q. Why does -- first of all, what does  
13 preparation of the cervix entail? What does that  
14 mean?

15 A. Yeah. It might entail different things for  
16 -- for each individual, but may include a combination  
17 of the medication misoprostol, which we've talked  
18 about previously, and potentially the use of the  
19 medication mifepristone as well in preparation of the  
20 cervix. And then also placement of osmotic dilators.

21 Q. What is it you're trying to achieve with  
22 this preparation? What exactly is the point of it?

23 A. Yeah, we -- preparation of the cervix, if we  
24 can help the cervix soften some and provide a little  
25 bit of a dilation before the dilation and evacuation



1 starts, the risks of, in particular, cervical  
2 laceration decrease.

3 Q. When you say "dilation," does that mean  
4 increase the diameter of it?

5 A. Yeah. In -- you know, in obstetrics,  
6 commonly refer to a cervix as -- as dilated in  
7 centimeters. So, you know -- if we -- if I do an exam  
8 of the cervix and the cervix is open one centimeter,  
9 then I say the cervix is dilated one, one centimeter.  
10 And that would be true for before a dilation and  
11 evacuation or, you know, if I'm examining a patient's  
12 cervix at the end of a pregnancy in preparation for  
13 birth.

14 Q. What is the typical intent or level of  
15 dilation that you're trying to achieve when you  
16 perform a D&E abortion?

17 A. There's no -- there's no standardized number  
18 that is required before a person, you know, could have  
19 the start of their D&E, necessarily.

20 Q. Why does the size or the diameter of the  
21 cervix dilation matter then if -- what are you trying  
22 to do by dilating it if the particular size doesn't  
23 matter?

24 A. The greater the -- I mean, the -- you know,  
25 as the pregnancy advances, the pregnancy gets larger.

1 And therefore, we have to have, you know, a larger  
2 space with which to be able to complete that  
3 evacuation safely.

4 Q. Meaning the fetus or the baby is getting  
5 bigger as the pregnancy progresses and it's just a  
6 tighter fit to pull the bigger baby out if the cervix  
7 isn't dilated. Is that what you mean?

8 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

9 THE WITNESS: Generally, when -- as  
10 we're, you know, providing a D&E for a patient, we  
11 need, you know, dilation of -- to some extent at -- at  
12 any gestation we're providing a D&E in order to be  
13 able to guide the products of conception through the  
14 cervix safely.

15 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And when you say guide them  
16 through, this isn't simply sticking -- this isn't  
17 simply applying a cannula, the tube, into the uterus  
18 and sucking out the contents because there's  
19 ossification and bone present and those bones won't go  
20 through the tube. Is that correct?

21 A. Well, the largest cannula that I've ever  
22 encountered in my practice is a 16-millimeter cannula.  
23 So that's the largest one we have at our -- at our  
24 ready to be able to use.

25 Q. Okay. I don't -- I don't see -- I don't

1 think that answered my question though.

2 A. Okay.

3 Q. And I'm not trying to be rude. I ---

4 A. Oh, no.

5 Q. I was asking if the reason you can't use  
6 just a cannula and do the aspiration at a certain  
7 point is because the fetus, the baby has gotten so big  
8 and the bones are developed and rigid, more rigid such  
9 that they won't just go through the tube. Is that  
10 correct, that's why you convert it to a D&E?

11 A. Yeah.

12 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

13 THE WITNESS: It's a -- it's a little  
14 bit difficult to answer specifically because, for  
15 example, if there were a 17-millimeter cannula and I  
16 was providing a D&E abortion for a patient at 17 weeks  
17 of pregnancy, it's conceivable that we would be able  
18 to provide an aspiration abortion at that time as  
19 well.

20 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. But since you have a  
21 16-millimeter cannula as the largest option available,  
22 at 17 weeks gestation age -- gestational age, it's  
23 your medical opinion that you would not be able to  
24 suck the contents out through the 16-millimeter  
25 cannula. Is that correct?

1           A.    It -- again, it depends a little bit on the  
2           nuances of each patient, but generally I don't expect  
3           to be able to complete the D&E at 17 weeks with  
4           aspiration alone.

5           Q.    With the D&E procedure, do you -- well,  
6           first of all, what are the options or the array of  
7           options that you have for surgical instruments related  
8           to the D&E procedure?

9           A.    Oh.  I mean, we have many different -- well,  
10          I mean, again, like I said previously, we -- even at  
11          the -- even for a D&E, we use a combination of  
12          instruments, typically forceps and aspiration.

13          Q.    Okay.  So forceps is one type of surgical  
14          tool that you use during D&E.

15          A.    Yes.

16          Q.    Are there any others that you've ever used?

17          A.    Well, let me think about that for a second.  
18          I don't think so, no.

19          Q.    Okay.  So when you say ---

20          A.    I can't -- I can't recall a time.

21          Q.    So when you say "surgical instruments,"  
22          you're really talking about forceps.  Is that correct?

23          A.    Yes.

24          Q.    And how big -- I mean, the forceps sort of  
25          have an X axis like scissors, if you will, and a clamp

1 on one end and a handle on the other end that you hold  
2 the handle in your hand. Is that correct?

3 A. How -- there certainly is a handle and then  
4 there's a -- on the end of the -- on the other -- on  
5 the opposite end of the forceps, there are, you know,  
6 fenestrations at the end that, you know, oppose each  
7 other directly, not necessarily in a, you know,  
8 crossing fashion like in a -- with a scissor.

9 Q. Right. They -- when you say fenestrations,  
10 are they like clamps or grabbers, like my hands here  
11 (demonstrates)?

12 A. Yeah, I mean, we call ---

13 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

14 THE WITNESS: We call them  
15 fenestrations.

16 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. Is there sort of a  
17 layperson word for fenestrations that you could help  
18 us understand?

19 A. There -- all the forceps I have used are  
20 metal. On the end of -- on the non-handle end of the  
21 forceps, there's typically a rounded opening --  
22 rounded opening on either side that then, you know,  
23 can come together and touch each other.

24 Q. Two loops that come together and ---

25 A. Loop. Yeah, loop is a -- probably a

1 good ---

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. --- description. Yeah.

4 Q. And they're metal on the fenestration or  
5 looped end? That's a metal instrument?

6 A. All the forceps that I've ever used are  
7 entirely metal.

8 Q. And how big are those loops? Are they, say,  
9 one inch in diameter? Are they ten millimeters in  
10 diameter? What's -- what would you say the size -- or  
11 are there different sizes?

12 A. It really depends on the forceps. Forceps  
13 aren't sized necessarily like a -- like a suction  
14 cannula would be. So really it just depends on the --  
15 on the forceps.

16 Q. Do you have multiple different forceps  
17 options, or is it all the same set of forceps you use  
18 every single time?

19 A. I have the same, you know, array of forceps  
20 available to me regardless of when I do or where I do  
21 a D&E, so both here at Planned Parenthood as well as  
22 at the university. You know, which one is required  
23 just depends on the, you know, individual patient  
24 characteristics, really.

25 Q. And when you say "on the individual patient

1 characteristics," are some of the forceps sort of  
2 wider at the fenestration or the loop side, the  
3 business end, if you will, the grabbers?

4 A. Sorry?

5 Q. Are they wider and bigger such that if the  
6 cervix isn't dilated to a certain point you wouldn't  
7 want to use the bigger one, you might use a smaller  
8 one?

9 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

10 THE WITNESS: The -- there are  
11 certainly different -- you know, the diameter of the  
12 fenestration of the -- or loop of the forceps can vary  
13 depending on the -- on the forceps, yes.

14 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you make a medical judgment  
15 based on the field presented, the operative field, as  
16 to what size forceps you choose. Is that correct?

17 A. Yeah. Generally, that's correct. You know,  
18 like with any -- certainly for D&E, that's similar to  
19 -- I mean, I don't use forceps for a diagnostic  
20 laparoscopy, for example. But I certainly would, you  
21 know, call for the instruments that made the most  
22 sense at the time based on my experience and training.

23 Q. So when you're performing a D&E, do you  
24 insert more than one forcep at a time inside the  
25 uterus or is it just one forcep at a time?

1           A.    I have never inserted more than one -- or  
2 placed more than one forceps at a time.

3           Q.    Okay. When you're doing a D&E and you place  
4 one forceps in -- tool in through the cervix into the  
5 patient's uterus, do you also have the cannula  
6 positioned through the cervix in the uterus at the  
7 same time?

8           A.    No. I cannot recall a time where that was  
9 true.

10          Q.    So when you're doing a D&E abortion, you  
11 don't have both the cannula and the forceps passing  
12 through the cervix at the same time. You only have  
13 one at a time. Is that correct?

14          A.    Yeah. Generally, I think that's, yeah, been  
15 my experience.

16          Q.    What do you do with the forceps? What is  
17 the actual technique that you are using those for in  
18 the D&E procedure?

19          A.    Yeah. So after the -- I pass the forceps  
20 through the cervix, I open them gently and guide the  
21 products of conception out through the cervix.

22          Q.    So you open the forceps gently, meaning you  
23 get the loops or the fenestrations apart. And then  
24 what do you do with them after you open it to guide  
25 the fetus or the baby out of the uterus?



1           A.    Yeah, so after the forceps are open, then I  
2    would close them, and whatever -- and then remove  
3    whatever tissue is between the fenestrations of the  
4    forceps. That could be, you know, any part of the  
5    pregnancy, including the placenta.

6           Q.    Okay. So you essentially put the forceps in  
7    closed, open them. Do you manipulate it at all at  
8    that point, or do you just open them and then close  
9    it?

10          A.    Typically, manipulation is -- like you're  
11    describing is not -- is not part of my practice.

12          Q.    Okay. So you open the forceps loops, you  
13    close them back and you then pull back the forceps  
14    through the cervix. Is that correct?

15          A.    As I -- as I try to instruct our trainees,  
16    our resident physicians, it's very much more a guiding  
17    of the tissue versus pulling. And that -- you know,  
18    the nuances of that are sometimes lost on them. But  
19    we discuss that at length because we want the -- I  
20    want, as the physician, as the surgeon, for that  
21    tissue to come through the cervix safely.

22          Q.    So the difference between guiding and  
23    pulling is sort of gently retracting it so it's not  
24    causing a cervical laceration. Is that the intent?

25          A.    Yeah. To prevent forcing the tissue to --

1 to go somewhere where it doesn't actually fit.

2 Q. And when you -- how many times does it  
3 typically take for you to position the forceps inside  
4 the uterus, open the loops, close them back, guide  
5 tissue out? How many times of that does it typically  
6 take for you to complete a D&E abortion?

7 A. Oh, that's -- that's a good question.  
8 Sometimes very few if a cervix is dilated, you know,  
9 quite -- you know, significantly. Sometimes, you  
10 know, depending on, again, patient characteristics  
11 and, you know, position of the products of conception,  
12 sometimes more. But I've never -- I don't think I've  
13 ever actually counted how many times.

14 Q. Have you ever had a situation where you  
15 opened the forceps in the uterus, closed them, guided  
16 the tissue out, and the whole fetus came out at one  
17 time?

18 A. No. No.

19 Q. Instead, do you typically close the -- put  
20 -- place the forceps in the uterus, open them, close  
21 them, guide the tissue out, and it's a portion of the  
22 fetus's body, so not the whole entire fetus intact,  
23 but a portion of it?

24 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

25 THE WITNESS: Yeah. Generally, in the

1 -- in the way that we provide dilation and abortion --  
2 dilation and evacuation abortion -- sorry, excuse my  
3 flub there.

4 Dilation and evacuation abortion, yes, the  
5 patient is counseled that it is unlikely that the  
6 products of conception would come out intact.

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you ever have a situation  
8 where you're performing a D&E abortion where the skull  
9 or the cranium is too big to fit through the cervix so  
10 you have to do something to reduce the size of the  
11 skull?

12 A. I'm sorry, can you rephrase your question  
13 again? I just want to make sure I'm understanding it  
14 correctly.

15 Q. So you've got the cervix opening, let's say  
16 it's three centimeters dilated. And you've got the,  
17 I'm going to say it wrong but, parietal bone  
18 measurements of the cranium.

19 A. Uh-huh (yes).

20 Q. That is, say, five centimeters. So just it  
21 won't fit. What do you do in that situation when the  
22 skull is bigger than whatever dilation level you have  
23 the cervix?

24 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

25 THE WITNESS: In that instance where

1 any part of the, you know, fetus is too large to pass  
2 through the cervix safely, then compressing the tissue  
3 is what we do.

4 Q. (Mr. Boyle) When you say you compress the  
5 tissue, speaking specifically about the skull itself,  
6 what do you mean by that?

7 A. That means the forceps is around the -- you  
8 know, we don't know specifically. On ultrasound, it's  
9 -- you know, for all my -- all my D&E procedures, I  
10 use ultrasound guidance. It's not always possible to  
11 know precisely what portion of the cranium that your  
12 forceps are, you know, directly on, but I -- we  
13 compress the tissue so that it will fit.

14 Q. So you compress the skull to collapse it.  
15 And then once it's collapsed, you extract it, you  
16 guide it back through the cervix. Is that what I  
17 understand?

18 A. Yeah. We compress ---

19 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. You  
20 can answer.

21 THE WITNESS: Thank you. We compress  
22 all the tissue so that it fits safely through the  
23 cervix.

24 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And the skull is the most --  
25 typically the biggest part that provides the most

1 difficulty in that D&E procedure. Is that correct?

2 A. Certainly -- you know, certainly, that's the  
3 -- again, if you were going to use ultrasound  
4 measurements, typically, that's the -- in all -- at  
5 all of the gestations where we provide induced  
6 abortion care, that's the -- typically the widest part  
7 of the fetus, yes.

8 Q. Do you ever take the cannula and insert it  
9 into the uterus, pass it through the cervix into the  
10 uterus and try to reduce the size of the skull with  
11 the cannula before you try and remove it with the  
12 forceps?

13 A. So not as part of my Planned Parenthood  
14 practice. There have -- at the university, I can  
15 think of less than a handful of a number of times  
16 where, because of the anomaly affecting the pregnancy,  
17 the cranium was significantly larger than normal.

18 And in order to -- and in one case,  
19 actually, you know, had become entrapped. The patient  
20 wanted an induction of labor at 22 weeks, but the  
21 cranium became trapped in the cervix. So to help her  
22 complete, you know, her desired induction, we -- I,  
23 you know, decompressed the cranium that way with using  
24 aspiration instead.

25 Q. With the guiding of the different parts of

1 the baby or the fetus out of the uterus through the  
2 cervix, once you get a portion out with the forceps,  
3 you guide it through the cervix, what do you do next  
4 with that portion that's being clasped by the forceps?

5 A. After it's passed through the cervix?

6 Q. Yes.

7 A. Typically, I have a tray. You know,  
8 typically I'm seated for dilation and evacuation  
9 procedures and I have a tray that's resting on my lap.  
10 And after the tissue is removed safely through the  
11 cervix, then I place the tissue on the tray.

12 Q. Okay. So you don't use suction from the  
13 cannula once it's past the cervix. You just use the  
14 forceps to remove it from the body -- from the  
15 patient's body and put it in a tray not using suction.  
16 Is that correct?

17 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

18 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I guess I just --  
19 if I'm -- I guess I just want to make sure I  
20 understand the question correctly. So I've used the  
21 forceps to remove a portion of the products of  
22 conception through the cervix, out past the introitus  
23 of the pregnant person and then I place it on the  
24 tray.

25 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. Yeah, I just didn't know

1 if once it -- I was asking if once you guided it  
2 through the cervix then you used the cannula ---

3 A. Oh, no.

4 Q. --- on that remnant and -- but, no, you  
5 extract it all the way sort of manually with the  
6 forceps ---

7 A. Yeah. That's my typical practice, yes, for  
8 sure.

9 Q. Do you use curettage for any of these  
10 surgical abortion procedures that you do?

11 A. Are you -- well, I mean, to be honest, the  
12 procedure in the first trimester is called a dilation  
13 and curettage, right, or D&C. But mostly -- so I  
14 guess it just depends on what you mean by curettage.

15 Q. What do you consider to be curettage?

16 A. I consider curettage to be use of a -- an  
17 actual curette, which is metal and has -- I'm not  
18 going to say sharp edges, but firm, thin edges, to --  
19 again, I don't prefer the word scrape ---

20 Q. Sort of like a -- sort of like a tongue  
21 scrapper but for a different part of your body?

22 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

23 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure what a  
24 tongue scrapper is but -- but, yeah, I mean, people  
25 colloquially kind of refer to curettage as scraping.

1 I think that's an intense word for what we're doing.

2 But I -- to, you know, get back to your  
3 question, if that's what we're defining as curettage,  
4 then I -- the last time I needed to use that in the  
5 setting of a procedural abortion was -- I don't know.  
6 It happens extremely rarely.

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. With the D&E abortion,  
8 after you have used the forceps to grasp and guide the  
9 bigger portions of the fetus or baby out of the  
10 uterus, what do you do after you -- you're done with  
11 the forceps portion of the procedure?

12 A. Yeah, so once I'm confident that we have,  
13 you know, nearly all the products of conception  
14 evacuated safely from the uterus, then I would advance  
15 a suction cannula to the fundus of the uterus, or the  
16 top, and aspirate any remaining decidual tissue,  
17 typically, that still remains within the uterus.

18 Q. When you say, "the fundus," or the top,  
19 that's the part farthest away from the cervix, so sort  
20 of up towards the rib cage and the lungs, that  
21 direction of the body?

22 A. Yeah. I guess. It's the portion of the  
23 uterus typically the furthest away both from me as the  
24 operator, as the surgeon and, as you described, from  
25 the cervix, yes.



1 Q. Is there anything else about the D&E  
2 abortion procedure that you do that we didn't cover or  
3 that we've missed?

4 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

5 THE WITNESS: As far as the procedural  
6 steps?

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Yes. The start to finish, how  
8 it -- how it actually unfolds and your process.

9 A. Yeah, I mean, for every procedure, we would  
10 start with a surgical timeout and make sure that the  
11 healthcare team, you know, was all on the same page  
12 and prepped and ready for the procedure that we  
13 planned. We discuss, you know, the patient's wishes,  
14 any allergies, planned anesthesia, type of specimen we  
15 will have at the end. You know, we do many things.

16 But if you're talking about the procedure,  
17 you know, the actual operating steps for me as  
18 surgeon, then we've described those pretty much in  
19 detail. The main last one is, you know, assessment of  
20 hemostasis and ensuring that bleeding is appropriate.

21 Q. You mentioned anesthesia. What type of  
22 anesthesia options are available for your patients who  
23 you are performing a D&E abortion on?

24 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

25 THE WITNESS: The patients that I see

1 have a -- a very wide range of anesthesia options.

2 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Such as?

3 A. Such as it is standard practice to ---

4 Q. Go ahead and drink water. I didn't mean to  
5 interrupt you. I'm sorry.

6 A. Oh, that's okay.

7 Q. Take your time.

8 A. I got this one.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. The standard practice, to use local  
11 anesthesia by the cervix for all patients unless, for  
12 example, a patient has a severe allergy. From there,  
13 patients can opt for mild sedation with medicine or  
14 moderate sedation with medicine, deep sedation with  
15 medicine or a general anesthesia.

16 Q. So local anesthesia, what's the actual  
17 anesthesia used there? Is it lidocaine or something  
18 like that?

19 A. Yeah. Typically, in our current practice,  
20 we use lidocaine plus or minus epinephrine.

21 Q. And that's standard for both aspiration and  
22 D&E unless the patient has a known allergy. Is that  
23 what I heard you say?

24 A. Yeah, generally, I think that's correct.

25 Q. Let's move on to the -- well, start at the

1 end. General anesthesia, that involves intubating a  
2 patient and putting them completely unconscious. Is  
3 that correct?

4 A. General -- again, I'm not an  
5 anesthesiologist, so this is my understanding of that  
6 realm of care. But general anesthesia involves  
7 medications for relaxation and then sometimes muscle  
8 paralysis, and then intubation with a endotracheal  
9 tube that then's connected to an anesthesia machine  
10 that provides oxygenation for the patient during that  
11 general anesthesia.

12 Q. You're not an anesthesiologist and ---

13 A. No.

14 Q. --- and so I'm ---

15 A. Thankfully, no.

16 Q. I'm not asking you for in-depth ---

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. --- general anesthesia opinions. But ---

19 A. Good.

20 Q. --- is it safe to say that if your patient  
21 is going through one of these two surgical procedures,  
22 and they ask for general anesthesia, you are not  
23 providing the general anesthesia? Is that correct?

24 A. No, I am not providing general anesthesia.

25 Q. Okay. So if the -- if your patient is

1 having general anesthesia, is it correct that there is  
2 an anesthesiologist also involved in that procedure?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Do you perform any procedures outside of a  
5 hospital -- let me just -- let me rephrase that.

6 Do you perform any D&E or aspiration  
7 abortion procedures outside of a hospital that use  
8 general anesthesia?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Okay. So when it comes to general  
11 anesthesia, you do all of those patients in the  
12 hospital setting for those procedures. Is that  
13 correct?

14 A. Currently, yes.

15 Q. Mild sedation, what's the process with that?  
16 Are you the doctor who is actually administering the  
17 mild sedation?

18 A. Yes. So I would prescribe an oral  
19 medication, typically a benzodiazepine, for the  
20 patient to take prior to their procedure.

21 Q. Okay. And do you have specialized training,  
22 or do you require specialized anesthesia training to  
23 provide mild sedation to a patient?

24 A. The medications used for mild sedation for a  
25 procedural abortion would be similar to those that are

1 -- and the very same that are sometimes used for other  
2 conditions in medicine, for example, extreme anxiety.  
3 So any physician can prescribe those medicines.

4 Q. Okay. So it's within your practice, then,  
5 to conduct mild sedation using benzodiazepine oral  
6 medication. Is that correct?

7 A. Absolutely.

8 Q. Okay. So you are the responsible doctor  
9 prescribing the mild sedation oral medication for your  
10 patients who opt for that type of sedation for the D&E  
11 and aspiration abortions. Is that correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Okay. Moderate sedation, what does that  
14 involve?

15 A. Moderate sedation, in our setting -- again,  
16 the official anesthesia definition is based on the  
17 kind of level of responsiveness of the patient. But  
18 in our -- both of our settings, typically moderate  
19 sedation includes the combination of two intravenous  
20 medications.

21 Q. Which two?

22 A. Typically, we use fentanyl and midazolam.

23 Q. Is midazolam a benzodiazepine?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Are there any other ways that you are aware

1 of to provide moderate sedation in your practice?

2 A. Those are the two medications that we --  
3 that we use for moderate sedation.

4 Q. And those are IV administered to your  
5 patients?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Are you the responsible doctor who is  
8 providing moderate sedation with those -- prescribing  
9 those two IV medications?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Can you perform mild and moderate sedation  
12 at the outpatient clinic, at the Planned Parenthood  
13 clinic that you perform surgical abortions at?

14 A. At Planned Parenthood North Central States,  
15 we offer patients who are having a procedural abortion  
16 to a -- you know, again, we talk to them about local  
17 anesthesia is a recommendation for any -- for  
18 everyone, and then give them the option to consider  
19 mild or moderate sedation if that's their preference.

20 Q. Okay. So you are acting within the scope of  
21 your practice in prescribing and monitoring patients  
22 who you're performing a surgical procedure on at the  
23 outpatient clinic when they opt for mild or moderate  
24 sedation. Is that correct?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Do you have any type of heart rate or  
2 oxygenation or any other type of monitoring on the  
3 patients who are undergoing moderate sedation?

4 A. We have extensive safety protocols regarding  
5 sedation of any kind in our -- in our setting -- in  
6 both settings, yes.

7 Q. And I'm speaking specifically about in the  
8 setting of your outpatient clinic, the Planned  
9 Parenthood clinic that you both provide clinical care  
10 at and are in the management of that clinic.

11 A. Uh-huh (yes).

12 Q. Do you have heart rate monitoring or  
13 oxygenation monitoring or respiratory monitoring for  
14 your patients who are undergoing moderate sedation  
15 there?

16 A. Yes. We are continually assessing vital  
17 signs throughout the procedure and measure heart rate  
18 and oxygenation during the procedure.

19 Q. So you actually have devices attached to the  
20 patient that have a constant monitoring of their heart  
21 rate and oxygenation. Is that correct?

22 A. That is correct.

23 Q. Okay. Do you have any anesthesiologists or  
24 CRNAs on-site at the Planned Parenthood clinic?

25 A. No, we don't. Because we can administer

1 moderate sedation or mild sedation, for that matter,  
2 safely in our setting ---

3 Q. Okay. So ---

4 A. --- without that.

5 Q. Sorry. So it's not required under Minnesota  
6 licensure and practice to have an actual specialist in  
7 anesthesia, either an anesthesiologist or a CRNA,  
8 present for you to prescribe mild or moderate sedation  
9 to your patient. Is that correct?

10 A. That is correct.

11 Q. Okay. Talk to me about -- well, and just to  
12 jump back to general anesthesia.

13 A. Sure.

14 Q. It is a requirement that you have a  
15 specialist, either an anesthesiologist or a CRNA or  
16 some combination of the two, if you're going to under  
17 -- if your patient is going to undergo general  
18 anesthesia. Is that correct?

19 A. I'm not trained in general anesthesia. So  
20 if my patient is planning that type of anesthesia,  
21 then, yes, I would -- I would request an anesthesia  
22 colleague to be present for that.

23 Q. And that does not occur at the outpatient  
24 Planned Parenthood clinic, the general anesthesia  
25 component. Is that correct?



1 A. Not currently.

2 Q. Has it ever?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Let's talk about deep sedation. What does  
5 that involve?

6 A. Deep sedation typically involves an IV  
7 medication called propofol.

8 Q. Is that it?

9 A. Yeah. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. So you're -- you've got a patient who  
11 chooses deep sedation, you're going to put that  
12 patient on IV propofol. Is that correct?

13 A. I don't administer intravenous propofol.

14 Q. Okay. So when a patient of yours selects  
15 deep sedation for an induced abortion surgical  
16 procedure, either D&E or an aspiration, you can't do  
17 that at the Planned Parenthood clinic, you have to do  
18 that at the hospital. Is that correct?

19 A. Current -- yes, currently all patients that  
20 desire deep sedation would be -- I would take care of  
21 them in the hospital setting.

22 Q. This IV propofol, when it's administered, do  
23 you have to have an anesthesiologist or a CRNA present  
24 to monitor the patient once the propofol is  
25 administered throughout the procedure?

1           A.    Well, again, in my setting, that's typically  
2   the case. I don't know the specific -- because it's  
3   not a medication I administer, I don't know the  
4   specific -- you know, both -- you know, if there's any  
5   law about that, because I don't -- I don't do that.  
6   I'm not -- I don't ---

7           Q.    And that's fair. It's outside your  
8   specialty.

9           A.    Yeah.

10          Q.    In your observation, you typically see some  
11   specialist, anesthesiology specialist monitoring that  
12   patient, but you don't know if that's required or not.  
13   Is that a fair way to say that?

14          A.    So every patient that I've taken care of  
15   that has had propofol administered, yes, there is  
16   someone trained with specific -- I'm sorry, you know,  
17   has either a CRNA, typically, or an anesthesia  
18   resident or an anesthesia attending physician.

19          Q.    And you would not convert a patient of yours  
20   in the Planned Parenthood setting -- if you were doing  
21   a aspiration or a D&E abortion in the Planned  
22   Parenthood clinic on your patient using mild or  
23   moderate sedation, you would not convert that patient  
24   to deep sedation during the procedure, would you?

25          A.    During the procedure, no, we don't have --

1 we don't have the medications on-site for conversion  
2 to deep sedation.

3 Q. Have you reviewed the sedation policy that  
4 Planned Parenthood South Atlantic produced in  
5 discovery in this case?

6 A. I have not.

7 Q. Would you agree that, in your practice, you  
8 would not give your patients at the Planned Parenthood  
9 clinic an option of deep sedation at your clinic  
10 setting to perform an aspiration or D&E abortion?

11 A. Currently, with the capacity that we have in  
12 our health centers that provide procedural abortion,  
13 we do not offer deep sedation.

14 Q. Because you don't have any specialist there  
15 who can actually monitor the patient under deep  
16 sedation and it's outside your scope of practice. Is  
17 that correct?

18 A. Yes. Because I don't -- I don't administer  
19 medications like propofol.

20 Q. And you are aware of what your Planned  
21 Parenthood informed consent and sedation and --  
22 minimal or moderate, paperwork looks like when you  
23 give your patients counseling about what type of  
24 sedation or anesthesia they have available to them?  
25 You're aware of that paperwork, right?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And you would not expect in your paperwork  
3 for the Minnesota Planned Parenthood clinic, where you  
4 are, that a patient could receive deep sedation at  
5 that Planned Parenthood clinic under any circumstance,  
6 right?

7 A. Well, for example, there may be an instance  
8 where we're planning to start offering that service  
9 where we would update the consent to reflect the  
10 option for deep sedation, you know, just prior to  
11 being able to offer that service.

12 Q. Are you aware of any anesthesiologists or  
13 CRNAs practicing at Planned Parenthood South Atlantic  
14 facilities in North Carolina?

15 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

16 THE WITNESS: I don't know -- other  
17 than Dr. Farris, I don't know any other physician  
18 that's employed by Planned Parenthood South Atlantic.

19 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So you don't know of any  
20 general -- I'm sorry, you don't know of any  
21 anesthesiologist or CRNA who practices at or with any  
22 of the Planned Parenthood South Atlantic facilities in  
23 North Carolina. Is that correct?

24 A. Again, the -- really, the only physician I  
25 know in North Carolina is Dr. Farris and my residency

1 colleague ---

2 Q. Well, I ---

3 A. --- who is an obstetric and gynecology  
4 physician.

5 Q. But you agree it wouldn't be safe in your  
6 practice in Minnesota to provide deep sedation at a  
7 Planned Parenthood clinic where you work there?

8 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

9 THE WITNESS: We -- we currently can't  
10 offer deep sedation based on the capacity and  
11 personnel that we have on staff.

12 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you're not aware of any  
13 reason or any practice with the Planned Parenthood  
14 South Atlantic in North Carolina facilities that they  
15 can provide deep sedation, are you?

16 A. I'm not aware whether they can or they  
17 cannot. I don't -- I'm not sure what, you know,  
18 personnel are on the -- on the payroll for that  
19 organization.

20 Q. If they do not have any anesthesiologists or  
21 CRNAs who are present and able to provide care to  
22 patients at the Planned Parenthood clinics in North  
23 Carolina, would you agree that it's not appropriate  
24 for them to offer deep sedation?

25 A. The facilities that I'm aware of, none of

1 which are in -- you know, I don't really know the  
2 details about any facilities in North Carolina, the  
3 specifics. The facilities that I am aware of that  
4 primarily offer abortion care that have the  
5 opportunity to provide deep sedation do have typically  
6 either a CRNA or an anesthesiologist overseeing that  
7 type of sedation.

8 Q. So you don't know anything about Planned  
9 Parenthood South Atlantic North Carolina facilities,  
10 operations or guidelines, or who they have present to  
11 assist with the performance of surgical abortions. Is  
12 that correct?

13 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

14 THE WITNESS: I know that they are very  
15 diligent about following the law in North Carolina.  
16 And I know, because they are a Planned Parenthood  
17 affiliate, that they have very -- very rigorous  
18 medically-evident -- you know, evidence-based  
19 guidelines for providing all the care they provide,  
20 including abortion care and including any type of  
21 sedation.

22 Q. (Mr. Boyle) You said you know that they're  
23 diligent about following the law. How do you know  
24 that? What facts do you have that inform your opinion  
25 about that?

1           A.     I've read Dr. Farris's declarations in this  
2     case. And as an employee of a Planned Parenthood  
3     affiliate, I know the rigorous attention to the  
4     medical evidence that all affiliates must be up to  
5     date on and providing for their patients.

6           Q.     But you don't have any specific facts about  
7     the North Carolina facilities. Is that correct?

8           A.     I don't practice in North Carolina, so no.

9           Q.     Do you know how far away from the North  
10    Carolina Planned Parenthood facilities the hospitals  
11    are located?

12          A.     I do not.

13          Q.     So you don't have any idea about how long it  
14    would take to transfer a patient from a Planned  
15    Parenthood facility in North Carolina to any hospital  
16    in North Carolina, do you?

17          A.     I do not.

18          Q.     So you don't have any opinions about whether  
19    it would be easy or not for Planned Parenthood North  
20    Carolina to transfer patients to hospitals in North  
21    Carolina, do you?

22          A.     I'm afraid that I'm not very up to date on  
23    my North Carolina geography, no.

24          Q.     I would've been shocked if your answer was  
25    different, but I just want to clarify. You don't know

1 anything about that ---

2 A. I lived in North Carolina once upon a time,  
3 but I have not.

4 Q. And I understand and I'm not trying to ---

5 A. No, that's okay.

6 Q. --- overkill it, but just so I'm clear on  
7 your answer. You don't have any opinions about  
8 whether there is a great distance between any Planned  
9 Parenthood facility in North Carolina and any hospital  
10 in North Carolina. Is that correct?

11 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.  
12 Apologies.

13 THE WITNESS: I don't have any  
14 information in my brain at this time about the  
15 distance, whether short or long or middle or however  
16 you would define those terms, between a health center  
17 -- Planned Parenthood health center in North Carolina  
18 and any type of hospital.

19 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you don't have any idea  
20 about what Planned Parenthood in -- facilities in  
21 North Carolina's procedures are to transfer patients  
22 to North Carolina hospitals because you haven't seen  
23 any of that information. Is that correct?

24 A. I have not seen them. However, again,  
25 because I'm an employee of a Planned Parenthood



1 affiliate and I know the rigorous protocols that we  
2 have for -- regarding any patient that needs transfer  
3 out of our facility, I am quite certain that Planned  
4 Parenthood South Atlantic has a similar rigorous  
5 protocol for any type of occurrence where a person  
6 might need to be transferred out of the health center.

7 Q. Well, I appreciate that you think that is  
8 probably the case, and you may even be right. But as  
9 we sit here today, you don't have any factual basis to  
10 make that other than your speculation of how your  
11 experience is with the Planned Parenthood parent  
12 organization. Is that correct?

13 A. All facilities as part of a Planned  
14 Parenthood affiliate go through what's called  
15 accreditation. And safety protocols, including for  
16 patients that need transfer outside of the health  
17 center, are required to continue to be a Planned  
18 Parenthood affiliate.

19 So at that level, I do know that there is a  
20 safety protocol that exists.

21 Q. Well, I appreciate ---

22 A. But I have -- but you're correct, I have not  
23 seen it with my eyeballs.

24 Q. Okay. And I appreciate that I think what  
25 you're saying is is they all should be. But you don't

1 know even if these North Carolina Planned Parenthood  
2 facilities are accredited, do you?

3 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

4 THE WITNESS: In order for the doors to  
5 be open, they must be up to date on accreditation.

6 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And again, not to get too deep,  
7 but I think what you're saying is in order for the  
8 doors to be open, they should be, but you don't know  
9 specifically whether they are or not in North  
10 Carolina, do you?

11 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

12 THE WITNESS: I mean, it's hard for me  
13 -- I mean, I don't -- I don't have really any detailed  
14 knowledge about the safety protocols other than the  
15 ones that I use, so...

16 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And just to close the loop on  
17 that. So you don't have detailed knowledge about  
18 what's going on in the North Carolina facilities. Is  
19 that correct?

20 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

21 THE WITNESS: Again, I know that in  
22 order to continue to be an accredited affiliate within  
23 our -- within in the Planned Parenthood Federation,  
24 that leadership in health centers must demonstrate  
25 that they are up to date and practicing in accordance

1 with the standards and guidelines of the federation.

2 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you don't know if the North  
3 Carolina facilities have done that, do you?

4 A. I mean, I don't know what -- on a intimate  
5 level what other -- what any other physician is doing  
6 in their -- in their practice.

7 Q. And I appreciate that. But that means you  
8 don't know what's going on at the North Carolina  
9 Planned Parenthood facilities in that regard. Is that  
10 correct?

11 A. I have ---

12 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

13 THE WITNESS: I have never been there  
14 or visited.

15 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you don't know what's going  
16 on with their accreditation or their safety policies,  
17 do you?

18 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

19 THE WITNESS: I can't -- it's hard for  
20 me to comment on care that's being provided in a place  
21 where -- you know, the specific details of that care  
22 when I've never been there to observe that care. I  
23 can speak most authoritatively to my own practice.

24 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Is infection a possible  
25 complication that can arise from induced abortion?

1           A.     Infection is a known risk associated with  
2 pregnancy and also induced abortion, yes.

3           Q.     Is bleeding or vaginal bleeding that  
4 qualifies as a Grade 2 or higher an adverse event --  
5 I'm sorry.

6                     Is bleeding or vaginal bleeding that  
7 qualifies as a Grade 2 or higher adverse event,  
8 according to the common terminology criteria for  
9 adverse events, a risk of a surgical abortion?

10                    MS. GRANDIN:  Objection to form.

11                    THE WITNESS:  Are you reading from a  
12 document that I could see, or -- I'm not sure what you  
13 mean by Grade 2.  That's not standard terminology in  
14 my practice.

15           Q.     (Mr. Boyle)  Okay.  Is bleeding or vaginal  
16 bleeding, heavy vaginal bleeding a risk that can  
17 accompany an induced abortion?

18           A.     Heavy vaginal bleeding, which typically,  
19 honestly, arises from the uterus -- so, you know,  
20 heavy bleeding in pregnancy can occur with spontaneous  
21 abortion.  It can happen with induced abortion.  It  
22 can also happen at the time of giving birth.

23           Q.     Is heavy bleeding a risk of both an induced  
24 abortion and a risk of an ectopic pregnancy?

25           A.     Bleeding can see -- be seen with both a

1 patient having an induced abortion and an ectopic  
2 pregnancy.

3 Q. Do you agree that pulmonary embolism is a  
4 possible complication that can arise from induced  
5 abortion?

6 A. Pulmonary embolism, again, is a extremely  
7 rare complication that can happen as a -- as a result  
8 of being pregnant. It is extremely rare after a  
9 person has an induced abortion. It is much more  
10 common and likely after giving birth.

11 Q. Is it a risk of an induced abortion that you  
12 describe to your patients when you are counseling them  
13 about their decision of whether to have an induced  
14 abortion?

15 A. We talk to patients having any sort of  
16 procedure in pregnancy, whether that's a procedural  
17 abortion or a cesarean section, about the risk of  
18 blood clot.

19 Q. And do you include deep vein thrombosis in  
20 that category of risks that you discuss with your  
21 patients in those circumstances?

22 A. Yes. I mean, we usually -- the language  
23 that we use with patients is typically blood clot,  
24 because that's a little bit more -- it's easier to  
25 wrap your head around. Most people don't know the

1 term deep vein thrombosis. Really, the -- you know,  
2 correct term is venous thromboembolism or VTE, which  
3 would encompass a deep vein thrombosis and a pulmonary  
4 embolism.

5 Q. Okay.

6 MR. BOYLE: Folks, we've been going for  
7 another hour. I'm at two hours. I suggest we take a  
8 break unless folks are wanting to keep pushing ahead.  
9 What do you all think?

10 MS. GRANDIN: Yeah, let's take a break.

11 MR. BOYLE: Okay.

12 MS. GRANDIN: Work for you, Dr. Boraas?

13 THE WITNESS: Yeah, that's fine.

14 MR. BOYLE: Very good.

15 THE COURT REPORTER: Off record at  
16 12:26 p.m.

17 (Brief recess: 12:26 p.m. to 12:39 p.m.)

18 THE COURT REPORTER: Back on the record  
19 at 12:39 p.m.

20 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Very good. Doctor, have you  
21 ever had to transfer a patient of yours who you were  
22 treating for an induced abortion, either surgical or  
23 chemical, from your Planned Parenthood clinic to a  
24 hospital because of a complication?

25 A. I have never had to transfer a patient with

1 a medication abortion. I have had a -- a patient that  
2 I had to transfer after a procedural abortion.

3 Q. How many patients have you had to transfer  
4 after a surgical abortion?

5 A. I actually don't have an exact number, but I  
6 can recall -- I can recall, you know -- I'm -- I --  
7 it's certainly not even one per year. Yeah.

8 Q. So somewhere around ten would be the number?

9 A. No. I mean, the ones that I can recall, I  
10 can only recall transferring two people.

11 Q. Would you agree that pelvic inflammatory  
12 disease is a possible complication from -- that can  
13 arise from an induced abortion?

14 A. As a trained gynecologist, a pelvic  
15 inflammatory disease is something that arises from  
16 upper genital tract disease typically associated with  
17 an infectious process.

18 Q. Right. And infection, I think we've already  
19 gone over, is a complication that can arise from an  
20 induced abortion. So sort of derivative from that,  
21 would you agree that pelvic inflammatory disease is  
22 also a complication that can arise from an induced  
23 abortion?

24 A. So infection after an induced abortion --  
25 you know, infection is a risk associated with

1 pregnancy and certainly with induced abortion as well.  
2 It's typically -- it's typically referred to as  
3 endometritis after a procedural abortion when we're  
4 talking about a infection that's affecting the uterus.

5 Q. Okay. Would you agree that endometritis, an  
6 infection of the uterus, is a possible complication  
7 that can arise from an induced abortion?

8 A. Yes. A very rare one.

9 Q. Okay. Would you agree that a missed ectopic  
10 pregnancy is a complication that can arise when you're  
11 providing an induced abortion for a patient?

12 A. I mean, if -- ectopic pregnancy is a -- is a  
13 reality of pregnancy in general. It's not more likely  
14 to be associated with induced abortion versus a  
15 population of people who aren't seeking an induced  
16 abortion.

17 Q. Okay. The general consensus, I believe, is  
18 that 2 percent of pregnant -- positive pregnancies are  
19 ectopic pregnancies. Is that correct?

20 A. I think, depending on the population, the  
21 exact point estimate differs, but somewhere between a  
22 -- probably a half point -- a half a percent up to  
23 three, depending on the population.

24 Q. And would you agree that a missed ectopic  
25 pregnancy, without regard to what the general sort of



1 prevalence of it is in any given population, that a  
2 missed ectopic pregnancy is a potential complication  
3 that can arise with providing an induced abortion to a  
4 patient?

5 A. I guess I'm not sure "missed" is the  
6 appropriate terminology here. People who come for  
7 induced abortion care are assessed for their risk of  
8 ectopic pregnancy regardless of what setting I'm  
9 working in in order to, you know, try to ensure the  
10 person is safe.

11 Q. If you have a patient who receives -- who  
12 you provide a chemical abortion to, and it's actually  
13 -- the patient actually has an ectopic pregnancy, do  
14 those two drugs that you provide the patient for the  
15 chemical abortion have any effect on the ectopic  
16 pregnancy?

17 A. The medicines that we use for medication  
18 abortion do not -- are not treatment for an ectopic  
19 pregnancy.

20 Q. So if the patient has an ectopic pregnancy  
21 and you are unaware of that and you provide a chemical  
22 abortion, that chemical abortion, those drugs, those  
23 two drugs that you provide that patient will not stop  
24 or end the ectopic pregnancy, will they?

25 A. So for a person that comes and requests a

1 medication abortion, we do extensive counseling about  
2 the expectations around what they might experience if  
3 they take the medicines, but also assess their risk  
4 for ectopic pregnancy.

5 So we certainly wouldn't provide medications  
6 for abortion like mifepristone and misoprostol if we  
7 thought a person had an ectopic pregnancy.

8 Q. Right. But sometimes you miss an ectopic  
9 pregnancy even if you do screening, right?

10 A. Sometimes, we're not able to diagnose it  
11 because we can't see it.

12 Q. On an ultrasound, right?

13 A. If a person has an ultrasound.

14 Q. So sometimes a patient who comes to you and  
15 asks for -- tests positive for pregnancy and asks for  
16 a chemical abortion has an ectopic pregnancy that you  
17 don't diagnose, and you give that patient the chemical  
18 abortion drugs, right?

19 A. So if someone screens low risk or -- and  
20 doesn't have an ultrasound or if a person has an  
21 ultrasound and we don't see an ectopic pregnancy, then  
22 those people can safely access medication abortion  
23 with mifepristone and misoprostol with close follow-up  
24 to ensure that the abortion was successful.

25 Q. But sometimes those people actually have an

1 ectopic pregnancy even if you think they were low risk  
2 or you took an ultrasound and did not locate the  
3 pregnancy. Is that correct?

4 A. Again, for a low-risk population, it's  
5 certainly something we discuss with people. But  
6 again, because the risk of ectopic pregnancy is so  
7 low, it's irrational to not provide the care that the  
8 person needs based on that very, very low risk unless  
9 that's a risk that's not acceptable to the patient.

10 Q. And I understand the question you're  
11 answering, but it's not really the question I'm  
12 asking.

13 A. Okay. Let me try again.

14 Q. Yeah. The -- and I appreciate your answer.  
15 It's fine. The question I am asking is, sometimes  
16 when those patients come to you, even if they are low  
17 risk after you screen them and even if you take an  
18 ultrasound and you cannot locate the pregnancy  
19 anywhere on the ultrasound: intrauterine, adnexa,  
20 wherever, sometimes those patients will have an  
21 ectopic pregnancy. Sometimes, it's too early to be  
22 seen on ultrasound and you just might not see it yet,  
23 but sometimes they will have an ectopic pregnancy,  
24 right?

25 A. Some -- a very small percentage of those may

1 go on to eventually be diagnosed with an ectopic  
2 pregnancy, yes.

3 Q. Okay. And in that situation, if you had a  
4 patient who you felt it was safe to give the chemical  
5 abortion drugs to even though they slipped through the  
6 screening process somehow and actually have an ectopic  
7 pregnancy, that particular patient who has ectopic  
8 pregnancy and chemical abortion drugs, those chemical  
9 abortion drugs don't do anything to stop the ectopic  
10 pregnancy, do they?

11 A. Not that is generally known within the  
12 medical community.

13 Q. Okay. Beyond unstudied and unsubstantiated  
14 possibilities, you use methotrexate to actually  
15 medically treat an ectopic pregnancy. Is that  
16 correct?

17 A. If a patient comes to me and has a known  
18 ectopic pregnancy, then I would -- based on, you know,  
19 various patient-level characteristics, I would discuss  
20 with that person their options for treatment, which  
21 would include expectant management with very close  
22 follow-up.

23 That meaning, you know, watch -- what  
24 colloquially people call "watch and wait" with good  
25 symptom assessment and, you know, kind of close

1 follow-up, or medication management with methotrexate  
2 typically, or a surgical procedure to treat the  
3 ectopic pregnancy.

4 Q. But in any event, the two chemical abortion  
5 drugs don't stop an ectopic pregnancy if they're given  
6 to a patient who actually has an ectopic pregnancy.  
7 Is that correct?

8 A. Not that we know.

9 Q. Okay. You agree that misoprostol has an FDA  
10 approval through ten weeks or 70 days. Is that  
11 correct?

12 A. Excuse me, can ---

13 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

14 THE WITNESS: Can you say that again?

15 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you agree that the FDA has  
16 approved misoprostol through ten weeks or 70 days?

17 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

18 THE WITNESS: Are you saying  
19 misoprostol, like m-i-s-o-p-r-o ---

20 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Mispronouncing that ---

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. --- because I have a terrible  
23 pronunciation ---

24 A. Oh, that's okay. I just wanted to make sure  
25 that I know what you're saying.

1 Q. Yes. I apologize.

2 A. Nope. Yep, that's okay. And your -- so now  
3 that I know what medicine you're discussing, can you  
4 say the rest of it again? I'm sorry.

5 Q. Yes. You agree that misoprostol has an FDA  
6 approval through ten weeks or 70 days, don't you?

7 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

8 THE WITNESS: My understanding of the  
9 FDA label is that medication abortion with a  
10 combination of mifepristone and misoprostol, the FDA  
11 label discusses using those medicines through 70 days  
12 of pregnancy.

13 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Let me ask a question about  
14 your CV. And I'm sure I'm just not quite following.  
15 It says that you got your fellowship in family  
16 planning from the Magee-Womens Hospital. But when I  
17 look that up, it looks like that's not a fellowship  
18 program. Is it just under the umbrella of the  
19 University of Pittsburgh?

20 A. Yeah. Let me clarify. So -- well, I guess  
21 I can't think of a good -- but, so, yes, the  
22 fellowship educational, you know, umbrella is the  
23 University of Pittsburgh and the specific site is  
24 Magee-Womens Hospital ---

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. --- and associated clinics.

2 Q. And you also got a degree in clinical  
3 research. Is that a Ph.D. or...

4 A. I have a master's degree in epidemiology.  
5 And then during my fellowship, I completed a  
6 certificate in clinical research because I already,  
7 you know, had a preceding master's degree.

8 Q. What is the Consortium of Abortion Providers  
9 that you list in your CV?

10 A. The Consortium of Abortion Providers is a  
11 group of healthcare professionals that provide  
12 abortion care committed to, you know, examining the  
13 evidence and producing evidence to help ensure we take  
14 the best care of people.

15 Q. And I apologize, I may have said it all  
16 wrong.

17 A. Oh, no.

18 Q. Is it Mifeprex that has the 70-day FDA  
19 approval? I might've gotten those two confused. One  
20 of them has a 70-day approval. Is that correct?  
21 Or...

22 A. The combination of mifepristone and  
23 misoprostol for induced abortion care to 70 days ---

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. --- is my understanding of the FDA label.

1 Mifeprex is actually a brand name, so we try to stick  
2 to saying the generic name mifepristone.

3 Q. Okay. It's easier for -- I can actually say  
4 Mifeprex so ---

5 A. Yeah. Yeah.

6 Q. You list in your CV that you received a  
7 fellowship in reproductive health advocacy from a  
8 group called Physicians for Reproductive Health in  
9 2014. Is that correct?

10 A. I did.

11 Q. And that's not a fellowship based on  
12 medicine or clinical research or clinical practice of  
13 medicine. Instead, it's a group of  
14 abortion-performing doctors who train how to speak to  
15 government officials and lobby them, and to speak to  
16 media and advocate for abortion. Is that correct?

17 A. The Physicians for Reproductive Health  
18 Leadership Training Academy was an opportunity that I  
19 was able to take advantage of because I was a fellow,  
20 but other physicians are able to apply for and be  
21 accepted into that program as well.

22 The fellowship included, yeah,  
23 evidence-based ways to communicate patient stories to  
24 multiple people, to coworkers, to family, to elected  
25 officials, to anybody really.



1 Q. Have you ever lobbied on behalf of abortion  
2 advocacy to any government officials?

3 A. I -- I'd have to look up the years to be  
4 specific, but I certainly have participated in ACOG,  
5 the American College of Obstetrics and Gynecology's,  
6 annual event called the Congressional Leadership  
7 Conference, which typically takes place in the spring.  
8 Although -- like spring, usually March, early April,  
9 approximately.

10 Which, again, lobbies for -- where we have  
11 the opportunity to talk with, ideally, our elected  
12 officials as constituents, but may -- this last time I  
13 participated was only staffers, about bills that are  
14 important for reproductive health generally.

15 So both for obstetric care as well as  
16 induced abortion and other aspects of ensuring people  
17 get the best healthcare when they're a young person  
18 seeking reproductive health.

19 Q. Do you agree that abortion -- induced  
20 abortion should not be banned after a certain point in  
21 a pregnancy?

22 A. I think bans severely -- I think any  
23 abortion ban severely limits our collective  
24 responsibility to people to ensure that they're able  
25 to access the healthcare that they need.

1 Q. So do you think, then, that abortion should  
2 be allowed up to a normal full-term pregnancy or 40  
3 weeks gestational age?

4 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

5 THE WITNESS: I have never met a  
6 patient who had a term pregnancy that desired an  
7 induced abortion.

8 Q. (Mr. Boyle) But do you support that type of  
9 induced abortion all the way up to the full term of  
10 pregnancy before the mother gives birth?

11 A. I think ---

12 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

13 THE WITNESS: I think defining a  
14 gestational age week is hard, because there are many,  
15 many patient factors that go into that  
16 decision-making. And again, as an obstetrician,  
17 people who get to term pregnancy don't -- they don't  
18 want an abortion. They want -- they want to continue  
19 their pregnancy and give birth.

20 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Have you ever performed an  
21 induced abortion on a patient who was beyond 30 weeks  
22 gestational age in pregnancy?

23 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

24 THE WITNESS: No.

25 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you think that there's any

1 limit that should be put on induced abortions at  
2 gestational age for any reason?

3 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

4 THE WITNESS: I think limits -- I think  
5 blanket limits are harmful to patient autonomy.

6 Q. (Mr. Boyle) How many induced abortions have  
7 you performed of any type for an unborn child or fetus  
8 with a gestational age of 24 weeks or more?

9 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

10 THE WITNESS: Again, I don't have a  
11 specific number. But because of the unique settings  
12 where I work, we are -- all of those patients that I  
13 would've taken care of in that gestational age range  
14 would've been diagnosed with a pregnancy with a  
15 life-limiting or a fatal lethal anomaly.

16 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So does Minnesota have laws  
17 that provide a limit to performing an induced abortion  
18 for a gestational age of the child or the fetus?

19 A. Minnesota does not have laws defining a  
20 specific gestational age week.

21 Q. You would agree that an unborn child or  
22 fetus, absent some anomaly like you mentioned, is  
23 typically viable or can live outside the womb after 24  
24 weeks gestational age, wouldn't you?

25 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

1 THE WITNESS: The general medical  
2 consensus about the periviable period, yes, includes  
3 the -- you know, the general consensus in my community  
4 is the 24 weeks and zero days would be a gestational  
5 age that if the patient, you know, had a complication  
6 of pregnancy that, with much support for many days,  
7 sometimes even more than a year, that fetus could be  
8 supported and -- outside the uterus.

9 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Could live outside the uterus,  
10 is that what you mean?

11 A. Yeah. Again, with support, typically  
12 extensive support.

13 Q. In your opinion, does the former North  
14 Carolina law that allowed abortion pretty openly up  
15 through 20 weeks, was that too restrictive in your  
16 opinion?

17 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. Calls  
18 for a legal conclusion.

19 THE WITNESS: Again, I think it's hard  
20 to define -- after sitting with many patients in this  
21 decision-making space, I think it's hard to define a  
22 specific week that honors the lived experience of  
23 patients.

24 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So you think a 20-week -- ban  
25 after 20 weeks is too restrictive?

1 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

2 THE WITNESS: To be honest, I'm not in  
3 favor of any ban. But I think there are plenty of  
4 circumstances -- albeit if you look up, you know, the  
5 overall percentage of how many abortions occur after  
6 20 weeks, the percentage is very low.

7 But again, for those patients, a ban after  
8 20 weeks doesn't honor their lived experience and the  
9 need for that healthcare.

10 Q. (Mr. Boyle) You understand that at least  
11 some people have the opinion that an abortion should  
12 be restricted after the unborn child or fetus has a  
13 heartbeat or to the first trimester, and some of those  
14 people believe that the unborn child or fetus is a  
15 separate human being who has their own life and,  
16 absent an induced abortion, would be able to progress  
17 and live their own life? Do you understand that ---

18 MS. GRANDIN: Object ---

19 Q. (Mr. Boyle) --- some people ---

20 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

21 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you understand that ---

22 MS. GRANDIN: Apologies. Objection,  
23 form.

24 MR. BOYLE: Okay.

25 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you understand that some

1 people have that opinion? Right?

2 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

3 THE WITNESS: Can you restate again in  
4 the -- what opinion people have so I can answer?

5 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Sure. And I understand we're  
6 going to get an objection. So I'll try and say it all  
7 and then objection, and then you answer if we can,  
8 okay?

9 MS. GRANDIN: Apologies.

10 MR. BOYLE: No. No problem.

11 THE WITNESS: Sorry.

12 MR. BOYLE: I kept rambling. It's not  
13 your fault. I'll try it better this time.

14 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you understand that at least  
15 some people have the opinion that abortion should be  
16 restricted because the unborn child has a heartbeat in  
17 the first trimester at some point and that the unborn  
18 child is its own separate person that can have a life  
19 if allowed to progress and be born?

20 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

21 THE WITNESS: I certainly, as a person  
22 who's awake many of the days in our country,  
23 understand that there are many legislatures trying to  
24 ban induced abortion care once fetal cardiac activity  
25 is detected on ultrasonography.

1 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So you're aware that some folks  
2 have that opinion. And I'm not suggesting you agree  
3 with it, but some people do have that opinion, right?

4 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

5 THE WITNESS: I mean, I can't -- I  
6 can't know other people's opinions unless they tell  
7 them to me.

8 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Would you think that someone  
9 who has that opinion is just always unreasonable or  
10 irrational?

11 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

12 THE WITNESS: I think -- I think that  
13 people are entitled to have beliefs about a lot of  
14 topics. Whether or not that relates to rationality, I  
15 think just depends on the topic.

16 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Well, and I appreciate that.  
17 On that particular topic, do you think it's just  
18 impossible for someone to have a reasonable opinion  
19 that says that?

20 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

21 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I'm not -- I'm not  
22 entirely sure. I think the -- well, of exactly what  
23 you're asking. You know, like, if people -- if a  
24 person I met had the opinion that elephants were  
25 endemic to the United States, I would say that's

1 irrational. That's not based in fact.

2 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you perform induction  
3 abortions?

4 A. I see patients that are in the second  
5 trimester that prefer induction, decide to proceed  
6 with induction abortion versus dilation and  
7 evacuation, yes.

8 Q. And you have performed those induction  
9 abortions, right?

10 A. I take care of patients who need an  
11 induction termination of pregnancy, yes.

12 Q. Can you tell me what does an induction  
13 abortion entail? What are the -- sort of like we went  
14 through aspiration and then D&E ---

15 MS. GRANDIN: Objection. Apologies.

16 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I will -- I will do  
17 my best. So typically, for the patients that I see  
18 needing an induction of -- induction for -- to end the  
19 pregnancy, typically are, you know, seen through our  
20 clinic. They are counseled about their options. They  
21 -- and the rest of induction versus dilation and  
22 evacuation versus continuing the pregnancy.

23 When they've made their own best healthcare  
24 decisions and decided to proceed with induction, then  
25 they would be -- receive, ideally, would -- because



1 it's the evidence-based protocol, a combination of  
2 medications very similar to those people ending their  
3 pregnancy in the first trimester, which would include  
4 mifepristone and misoprostol.

5 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Is there anything beyond giving  
6 those patients who choose to have an induction  
7 abortion those two drugs that you do to perform the  
8 induction abortion?

9 A. The most effective regimen to ensure the  
10 successful completion of their termination of  
11 pregnancy via induction would be to administer  
12 mifepristone and misoprostol.

13 Typically -- well, at times, people are also  
14 interested and we counsel patients about the options  
15 for pain control during that process because it's a  
16 much longer process than dilation and evacuation would  
17 be.

18 Q. So as I understand it, an induction abortion  
19 performed later in the second trimester is really just  
20 like a chemical abortion that you'd perform in the  
21 first trimester, it just takes longer?

22 A. The combination ---

23 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. Go  
24 ahead.

25 THE WITNESS: The combination of

1 medicines is the exact same. The dosing of  
2 misoprostol is typically different.

3 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Is there any surgical or  
4 procedural component of an induction abortion in  
5 addition to the chemical or medicine?

6 A. So induction of labor in the second  
7 trimester, you know, one of the risks that we discuss  
8 with people is the need for a, you know, procedure  
9 during the process. Typically, that would be for  
10 concern for a significant amount of bleeding.

11 So that's one of the things that we discuss  
12 with patients when they're -- when they're deciding  
13 between mode -- the mode of ending the pregnancy in  
14 the second trimester.

15 Q. And what type of procedure is it that you  
16 would possibly need to perform during that induction  
17 abortion?

18 A. It kind of depends on the patient-level  
19 characteristics again. You know, the most common  
20 reason that people need a procedure would be for a  
21 retained placenta.

22 Q. And what type of procedure would you perform  
23 on a patient that had a retained placenta under those  
24 circumstances?

25 A. Well, you know, to, like, be the most

1     succinct, we go in and get the placenta. So -- and  
2     that depends on the provider, honestly, whether or not  
3     they would feel comfortable using an instrument like a  
4     forceps for that. Certainly, I do with ultrasound  
5     guidance. Other people, depending on their training,  
6     may use aspiration or suction alone.

7           Q.     So you said the most common is retrieval of  
8     retained placenta. What other circumstances have you  
9     confronted in addition to that most common one?

10          A.     Well, for -- I've never -- I've never needed  
11     to provide a procedure for a patient who was having an  
12     induction abortion in the second trimester other than  
13     to help the placenta -- you know, to evacuate the  
14     placenta.

15          Q.     So the chemical abortion drugs are given in  
16     different doses to essentially stop the growth and  
17     development of the baby or the fetus at that point.  
18     And then the second drug promotes the uterus to expel  
19     the fetus or the baby, and basically the mother  
20     delivers the -- the now terminated baby or fetus. Is  
21     that correct?

22          A.     That was a lot of steps for that question,  
23     so I'll just kind of describe what happens. So  
24     mifepristone -- the science behind mifepristone in use  
25     for induction termination of pregnancy in the second

1 trimester is really to provide cervical softening and  
2 also to provide the decidual necrosis so the  
3 supporting tissue around the pregnancy starts to be  
4 less supportive.

5 And then when we add misoprostol, when we  
6 administer misoprostol, the action of misoprostol is  
7 to provide uterine contraction so that the pregnancy  
8 will pass. Typically, patients need more than one  
9 dose of misoprostol to accomplish that fully.

10 Q. And so that would be a more fully formed  
11 baby/fetus that looked like a baby because it's later  
12 in the second trimester. Is that correct?

13 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

14 THE WITNESS: It really depends on what  
15 gestational age we're talking about when the patient  
16 starts the induction of labor to -- for abortion. In  
17 my experience, people who select induction of labor  
18 versus a dilation and -- a dilation and evacuation are  
19 hoping that they will be able to see -- are hoping  
20 that the pregnancy will pass intact.

21 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you use a differential  
22 diagnosis in your clinical practice?

23 A. I would, yeah, venture to guess pretty much  
24 every day.

25 Q. Do you agree that a differential diagnosis

1 should include all of the possible risks or dangerous  
2 situations for a patient that you are treating?

3 A. I mean, a differential diagnosis is simply a  
4 list of possible diagnoses for a certain constellation  
5 of signs or symptoms that a patient is reporting.

6 Q. And typically when you develop that list of  
7 possible risks or situations a patient might be  
8 facing, your job as a doctor is to treat the worst  
9 first, right? You have to focus on the things that  
10 could be life threatening, don't you?

11 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

12 THE WITNESS: My job is to -- to know  
13 the list and communicate the list of possible  
14 diagnoses to the patient. Only the patient can decide  
15 what risks and -- to accept for a given diagnosis.  
16 It's not my job to say what risks a person should  
17 accept or shouldn't.

18 Q. (Mr. Boyle) You said you're a member of  
19 ACOG, right?

20 A. I am a member of ACOG, yes.

21 Q. Do you follow and agree with the practice  
22 bulletins that ACOG publishes?

23 A. I mean, generally, I think that's true.  
24 Some of -- you know, there are committees that review  
25 those regularly.

1 Q. Do you agree that ACOG practice bulletins  
2 provide clinical management guidelines for OB/GYNs?

3 A. Generally speaking, yes. I think the hard  
4 part about practice bulletins, again, is it's a  
5 collated document of evidence about a specific topic,  
6 and patients, individual patients, you know, in my  
7 experience, don't always fit guidelines or, you know  
8 -- you know, fit specific algorithms.

9 So that's when the clinical judgment based  
10 on experience and training of each individual treating  
11 physician comes into play.

12 Q. You said in your report, your declaration,  
13 that you were asked whether there is any medical  
14 justification for the two challenged provisions in  
15 relation to the Court deciding the Preliminary  
16 Injunction Motion. Who asked you to do that?

17 A. Who asked me to serve as an expert witness  
18 in this case?

19 Q. Who asked you whether there was any medical  
20 justification for the two challenged provisions?

21 A. I would have to understand which challenged  
22 positions you're referring to, I guess, first.

23 Q. Right. I -- I think we talked earlier about  
24 the IUP documentation is one and then the 12 -- after  
25 12-week hospitalization for induced abortion was the

1 other, right?

2 A. So I reviewed with counsel the -- my  
3 opinions based on experience and training for both the  
4 requirement for induced abortion care for rape and  
5 incest and life-limiting fetal anomaly to be provided  
6 in a hospital after the 12th week.

7 And I also discussed the specific portion  
8 about requiring the -- or documenting the existence of  
9 an intrauterine pregnancy before a medication  
10 abortion.

11 Q. Do you know what the legal standard is for  
12 those issues before the Court at the preliminary  
13 injunction?

14 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. Calls  
15 for a legal conclusion.

16 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I'm not an  
17 attorney, so I'm not sure I understand what you mean  
18 by "legal standard." I'm not -- I can't remember what  
19 you said.

20 Q. (Mr. Boyle) When you have a woman you're  
21 treating as your patient who has a positive pregnancy  
22 test, what do you consider to be on her differential  
23 diagnosis as potential medical risks and issues for  
24 her?

25 A. If I have a pregnant person sitting in front

1 of me, there are an exhaustive number of risks that I  
2 would think about for -- that might occur in a  
3 pregnancy.

4 Q. Such as?

5 A. Such as nausea and vomiting of pregnancy,  
6 such as high blood pressure diseases of pregnancy like  
7 gestational hypertension or preeclampsia. Like the  
8 need for a cesarean section, like the risk of pre-term  
9 birth, like the risk of a premature rupture of  
10 membranes, like bleeding in early pregnancy, the --  
11 like -- I mean, the -- the list goes on.

12 Q. Do you consider the possibility of an  
13 ectopic pregnancy to be one of those risks that's  
14 immediately on every differential diagnosis ---

15 A. Of ---

16 Q. --- for your patients who have tested  
17 positive for pregnancy?

18 A. Yeah. If somebody calls and reports a  
19 positive pregnancy test at home, again, we would do a  
20 thorough screen of the patient's history and try to  
21 determine their risk for an ectopic pregnancy.

22 Q. Do you agree that unless they are discovered  
23 and treated early almost 40 percent of ectopic  
24 pregnancies rupture suddenly causing pain and bleeding  
25 in the abdominal cavity?



1 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

2 THE WITNESS: I'd have to see the  
3 specific text where that exact number is quoted. I  
4 can, you know, say as a practicing gynecologist, you  
5 know, when we identify an ectopic pregnancy, we  
6 usually talk about -- we counsel patients about the  
7 risks and benefits of expectant management versus  
8 medical management versus surgical management.

9 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you agree that ruptured  
10 ectopic pregnancies can be fatal?

11 A. Can be what?

12 Q. Fatal.

13 A. Fatal. Yes. Although, thankfully, in the  
14 U.S., you know, in 2023, I don't know of a time where  
15 that's happened in my hospital.

16 Q. Has it ever happened, that you're aware of,  
17 from one of the Planned Parenthood patients that you  
18 see in Minnesota?

19 A. Nope. Not that I'm aware of.

20 Q. And we mentioned this earlier, and I got  
21 this number from the ACOG bulletin 193, which is the  
22 clinical management guidelines for OB/GYNs for tubal  
23 ectopic pregnancy from March of 2018. Are you  
24 familiar with this document, this bulletin?

25 A. I have seen ---

1 MS. GRANDIN: Objection. Go ahead.

2 THE WITNESS: I have seen this practice  
3 bulletin, yes.

4 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. And that's -- this  
5 practice bulletin says, "According to the CDC, ectopic  
6 pregnancy accounts for approximately 2 percent of all  
7 reported pregnancies." Does that sound accurate to  
8 you?

9 MS. GRANDIN: Objection.

10 THE WITNESS: I mean, again, it would  
11 be best to view the document and -- in order for me to  
12 authoritatively answer that question.

13 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you have a copy of it in  
14 front of you?

15 A. Not currently.

16 Q. We had discussed having available these  
17 documents. Do you have the ability to pull that up  
18 and look at it?

19 A. Yes. I should have that ability.

20 Q. Yeah, just take your time and let me know  
21 when you get it.

22 A. Okay.

23 MS. GRANDIN: Are you introducing this  
24 as an exhibit, Mr. Boyle?

25 MR. BOYLE: Maybe.

1 MS. GRANDIN: Okay.

2 MR. BOYLE: I don't know yet.

3 THE WITNESS: Okay.

4 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Let me know when you get it  
5 pulled up.

6 A. I will. My computer is exceedingly slow.

7 Q. Yeah, that's why I always print these  
8 things.

9 MR. BOYLE: I'll tell you what. We're  
10 at about two hours and 50 minutes, and I'm not going  
11 to be done in ten or 15 minutes.

12 THE WITNESS: Okay.

13 MR. BOYLE: Do you want to take a  
14 little bit of a longer break now and -- maybe take 30  
15 minutes and come back and finish up? And hopefully,  
16 you can get that pulled up in the interim.

17 THE WITNESS: Sure. That sounds fine  
18 to me.

19 MR. BOYLE: Does that work for you,  
20 Ms. Grandin?

21 MS. GRANDIN: Yes. Can we go off the  
22 record to talk about timing?

23 THE COURT REPORTER: Off the record at  
24 1:23 p.m.

25 (Luncheon recess: 1:23 p.m. to 1:52 p.m.)

1 THE COURT REPORTER: Back on the record  
2 at 1:52 p.m.

3 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. So, Doctor, do you have  
4 that ACOG Practice Bulletin 193 from March 2018  
5 available?

6 A. I do. I have it pulled up here in PDF on my  
7 computer.

8 Q. Okay. Do you agree with the -- that ACOG  
9 bulletin 193 that, quote, "Despite improvements in  
10 diagnosis and management, ruptured ectopic pregnancy  
11 continues to be a significant cause of  
12 pregnancy-related mortality and morbidity.

13 "In 2011 to 2013, ruptured ectopic pregnancy  
14 accounted for 2.7 percent of all pregnancy-related  
15 deaths and was the leading cause of hemorrhage-related  
16 mortality," end quote?

17 A. Gosh, that's a long sentence. If you could  
18 point me kind of specifically in the document where  
19 you're discussing, then I can ---

20 Q. Yeah. In the first page, "Background  
21 Epidemiology," about halfway through that paragraph.

22 A. Okay.

23 Q. "Despite improvements..." Do you agree that  
24 that's what the ACOG says on this topic?

25 A. Yep. That -- what you read there is written

1 here in that -- in this practice bulletin, yes.

2 Q. Is that -- and you agree with the ACOG  
3 bulletin, right?

4 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

5 THE WITNESS: You know, I haven't seen  
6 any specific mortality data related to ectopic  
7 pregnancy in those specific years, but I know ACOG  
8 takes, you know, the production of their practice  
9 bulletins very seriously.

10 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you rely on these practice  
11 bulletins in your practice to provide you with  
12 clinical management guidelines, right?

13 A. As a -- as a starting point, sure. Yeah.  
14 Yes.

15 Q. If you look under -- sorry. If you look  
16 under the "Risk Factors" section, do you agree with  
17 ACOG that, quote, "Half of all women who receive a  
18 diagnosis of ectopic pregnancy do not have any known  
19 risk factors," end quote?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And so a lot of women who actually end up  
22 having an ectopic pregnancy don't have flags for known  
23 risks for an ectopic pregnancy. Is that correct?

24 A. Based in their history, not necessarily  
25 what's happening in their body currently, yes.

1 Q. At what stage in pregnancy do you normally  
2 screen a woman for an ectopic pregnancy?

3 A. Well, certainly if I'm taking care of a  
4 patient doing their prenatal care visit at 30 weeks, I  
5 usually don't discuss ectopic pregnancy at that time.  
6 I don't know if you're asking for a specific  
7 gestational age week.

8 I try to assess -- you know, once a pregnant  
9 person has had a positive test, a positive pregnancy  
10 test, we -- one of the first things we do is talk  
11 about how they're feeling in their body and ask about  
12 last menstrual period to try to assess an estimated  
13 gestational age of the pregnancy.

14 Q. And so as I understand it, whenever you  
15 become aware that your patients has -- patient has  
16 tested positive for pregnancy, you consider an ectopic  
17 pregnancy as a risk on that patient's differential  
18 diagnosis, right?

19 A. Generally speaking, sure. Yes.

20 Q. And you screen that patient as soon as you  
21 become aware that they're pregnant for ectopic  
22 pregnancy immediately, right?

23 A. I mean, we have -- in all the locations  
24 where I work, we have -- we have, you know, kind of  
25 general protocols about how to assess somebody's risk

1 for an ectopic pregnancy. One of which is, you know,  
2 just talking about past history, as we've described.  
3 The other is to talk about any current signs or  
4 symptoms that might be concerning for an ectopic  
5 pregnancy.

6 Q. And the gold standard to test and look for  
7 an ectopic pregnancy is to conduct a transvaginal  
8 ultrasound and see if there is an embryo or fetus  
9 inside the uterus. Isn't that right?

10 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

11 THE WITNESS: There are, you know, kind  
12 of five main categories of early pregnancy. Much of  
13 which can rely on ultrasonography.

14 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Yeah. My question was, the  
15 gold standard to test and look for an ectopic  
16 pregnancy is to conduct a transvaginal ultrasound and  
17 see if there is an embryo or fetus seen in the uterus.  
18 Isn't that right?

19 A. The only ---

20 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

21 THE WITNESS: The only way to  
22 definitively diagnose an ectopic pregnancy is to see  
23 an embryo outside of the uterus with ultrasound. It  
24 doesn't necessarily have to be a transvaginal one.

25 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. So you can do a

1 ultrasound outside the woman's body ---

2 A. Again, it really -- it really just depends  
3 on the patient characteristics. But yes, we, at  
4 times, certainly can use transabdominal  
5 ultrasonography also.

6 Q. You said the only time you can definitively  
7 diagnose it is when you do the ultrasound and see the  
8 ectopic pregnancy. Did I hear you correctly?

9 A. So what -- if we're using ultrasound in  
10 early pregnancy, there are kind of five main diagnoses  
11 we could come up with, right? The first is a definite  
12 intrauterine pregnancy. The second is a probable  
13 intrauterine pregnancy. The third is a pregnancy of  
14 unknown location. The fourth is a probable ectopic  
15 pregnancy. And the fourth is -- or the fifth, excuse  
16 me, the fifth is a definite ectopic pregnancy.

17 Q. But under those categories, number one, if  
18 you do the ultrasound and you see the pregnancy inside  
19 the uterus, you've ruled out ectopic pregnancy there,  
20 right?

21 A. In the -- in the vast majority of cases,  
22 yes.

23 Q. You agree that you should always perform an  
24 ultrasound on a patient you provide care to when they  
25 test positive for pregnancy so that you can confirm if



1 the pregnancy is intrauterine by seeing it on an  
2 ultrasound, don't you?

3 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

4 THE WITNESS: Not all patients in early  
5 pregnancy need an ultrasound.

6 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Why not?

7 A. Lots -- various reasons.

8 Q. Is there any contraindication to giving a  
9 patient an ultrasound?

10 A. The first and foremost would be the patient  
11 doesn't want one.

12 Q. But you can't see inside the patient's  
13 abdomen to see if the pregnancy is intrauterine or  
14 ectopic unless you do an ultrasound, can you?

15 A. The way I could see inside the abdomen would  
16 be to provide a laparoscopy or to provide an  
17 exploratory laparotomy or any imaging modality that we  
18 have available, such as ultrasound, such as CT, such  
19 as MRI.

20 Q. Right. But you're not going to do a  
21 exploratory surgery or an MRI. You just do an  
22 ultrasound to see where the pregnancy is, right?

23 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

24 THE WITNESS: I would recommend an  
25 ultrasound if it was indicated.

1 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And a pregnant patient who you  
2 don't know if it's ectopic or not, you have ectopic  
3 pregnancy on that pregnant patient's differential  
4 diagnosis until you can confirm that it's in the  
5 uterus or not, correct?

6 A. There are many ways to assess a person's  
7 risk for an ectopic pregnancy. One of which is using  
8 ultrasound. There are many others.

9 Q. Do you agree with ACOG bulletin 193 which  
10 says, "The minimum diagnostic evaluation of a  
11 suspected ectopic pregnancy is transvaginal ultrasound  
12 evaluation and confirmation of pregnancy"?

13 A. Can you point me to exactly where in the  
14 document you're referring to?

15 Q. Yeah. It's on the second page under  
16 "Clinical Considerations and Recommendations. How is  
17 an ectopic pregnancy diagnosed?" I believe it's the  
18 first sentence there.

19 A. So for a patient with a suspected ectopic  
20 pregnancy, ultrasound can be very valuable. Most  
21 oftentimes, we would use a transvaginal  
22 ultrasonography. However, like I said previously, in  
23 select patients, transabdominal ultrasound --  
24 ultrasonography would also suffice.

25 Q. Okay. So you agree with ACOG on that

1 particular sentence?

2 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

3 THE WITNESS: I agree with the  
4 statement that diagnostic evaluation of a suspected  
5 ectopic pregnancy would -- you know, that ultrasound  
6 would be valuable in that case.

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) But ectopic pregnancy is on the  
8 differential diagnosis for every pregnant woman until  
9 you actually rule it in or rule it out, isn't it?

10 A. That -- it's on the differential, but I  
11 don't suspect it in every case, partly because ectopic  
12 pregnancy is very rare compared to intrauterine  
13 pregnancy. And I also take many more factors about  
14 each individual patient into consideration when I'm  
15 deciding whether or not I suspect an ectopic pregnancy  
16 or not.

17 Q. All you'd have to do is do an ultrasound and  
18 you'd be able to tell one way or the other if it's  
19 intrauterine pregnancy or ectopic pregnancy. It  
20 doesn't seem that difficult. Why can't you do that  
21 for all your patients? Are you -- I don't understand.

22 A. Because ultrasound ---

23 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. Go  
24 ahead.

25 THE WITNESS: Because ultrasound isn't

1 indicated for every pregnant person that I see. Many  
2 people have pregnancies that don't -- that don't ever  
3 have an ultrasound.

4 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you agree with ACOG bulletin  
5 193 where it says that, quote, "Serum hCG values alone  
6 should not be used to diagnose an ectopic pregnancy  
7 and should be correlated with the patient's history,  
8 symptoms and ultrasound findings," end quote?

9 A. Yeah, where in the document are -- is that  
10 section?

11 Q. If you look at the "Serum Human CHG -- hCG  
12 Measurement" section, second sentence.

13 A. Under the heading "Trends of Serial Serum  
14 Human Chorionic Gonadotropin," under that section?

15 Q. Yeah, under "Serum hCG Measurement."

16 A. Oh, okay, I see where you're saying now.  
17 And where?

18 Q. Second sentence.

19 A. Second sentence.

20 Q. Do you see that?

21 A. I see that the practice bulletin has that  
22 quote in it, yes.

23 Q. So you would agree that, at least according  
24 to the ACOG practice bulletin, it recommends that  
25 patients get ultrasound to determine the location of

1 the pregnancy?

2 A. In my practice, we use serum hCG levels in  
3 conjunction with patient history, symptoms and, at  
4 times, ultrasound.

5 Q. Right. And I understand that's what you say  
6 in your practice. But the ACOG here says that you use  
7 serum hCG with an ultrasound, right?

8 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

9 THE WITNESS: It also states in the  
10 practice bulletin, the sentence immediately preceding  
11 that, that "Measurement of the serum hCG level aids in  
12 the diagnosis of women at risk of ectopic pregnancy."

13 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Right. It says it aids in  
14 it ---

15 A. It says ---

16 Q. --- however ---

17 A. The sentence to follow describes assessment  
18 of a patient at risk for ectopic pregnancy.

19 Q. And you just disagree that every patient is  
20 at risk for ectopic pregnancy because you think that  
21 the way you screen them means you don't have to  
22 consider certain patients at risk. Is that fair?

23 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

24 THE WITNESS: Again, the only way to  
25 diagnose a definitive ectopic pregnancy is to see that

1 pregnancy outside the uterus. For patients that come  
2 in early pregnancy and request any care, including  
3 abortion care, we do a thorough history assessment and  
4 recommend the best care for that patient and  
5 consistent with medical evidence.

6 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And you've run studies on  
7 whether a patient who is pregnant needs an ultrasound  
8 to confirm an ectopic pregnancy early in their  
9 pregnancy or if you can just use screening to  
10 determine whether they are at risk for an ectopic  
11 pregnancy. Is that correct?

12 A. I have published articles assessing  
13 history-based screening in early pregnancy for  
14 abortion care, yes.

15 Q. And that is not the consensus position. It  
16 is what you are advocating for through your research  
17 should become the consensus position, but it is not  
18 established as the consensus position, is it?

19 A. By "consensus," are you referring to the  
20 practice bulletin?

21 Q. Yes.

22 A. The practice bulletin states, right, for  
23 people at risk of ectopic pregnancy, that serum hCG  
24 should correlate with patient history, symptoms and  
25 ultrasound findings. So we do our due diligence to

1 provide best healthcare to people to ensure that we  
2 are assessing people for either high risk for ectopic  
3 pregnancy or low risk for ectopic pregnancy.

4 You will also recall that this publication,  
5 the practice bulletin about tubal ectopic pregnancy,  
6 was published in March of 2018. So it is not uncommon  
7 when research is produced showing safety, for example,  
8 in this case, providing abortion for people with  
9 pregnancy of unknown location, that it takes a few  
10 years for those document -- consensus documents, as  
11 you referred to them, to be updated and published.

12 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And there isn't a consensus  
13 document from the ACOG that says your version of  
14 screening without ultrasound is accepted in the  
15 practice yet. Is that correct?

16 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

17 THE WITNESS: The study that I  
18 published was just published in 2013, so I doubt -- I  
19 doubt they've had time to update the practice  
20 bulletin.

21 Q. (Mr. Boyle) And I think you just said it  
22 was published in 2013, but it was published in ---

23 A. I'm sorry, I meant 2023. I am so sorry.

24 Q. Yeah, yeah. That's okay. I was just ---

25 A. Thank you. Thank you ---

1 Q. No, I understood what you meant.

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. Right. So -- and I appreciate that it's  
4 fairly new research. But even if it eventually gets  
5 adopted, the current standard of care for patients who  
6 appear with a pregnancy and you don't know if it's an  
7 ectopic pregnancy -- first of all, I think we've  
8 established -- let me clarify. You agree that every  
9 pregnant woman is at risk on some level for an ectopic  
10 pregnancy, right?

11 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

12 THE WITNESS: No.

13 Q. (Mr. Boyle) You don't think that every  
14 woman who is pregnant, early in their pregnancy before  
15 you're able to establish through other means that it's  
16 intrauterine, you don't think you have to treat every  
17 single patient as potentially having an ectopic  
18 pregnancy when they test pregnant -- positive for  
19 pregnancy?

20 A. If someone hasn't -- doesn't have a  
21 intrauterine pregnancy or a probable intrauterine  
22 pregnancy, then, yes, we counsel those patients about  
23 the potential, albeit low, risk, right? We've  
24 discussed the risks of ectopic pregnancy generally in  
25 this deposition already. That low risk that a -- the



1 pregnancy may be growing outside the uterus.

2 Q. And it's fairly simple to conduct an  
3 ultrasound and find out if it's intrauterine, which  
4 would relieve that risk. Or if you see it  
5 ectopically, it would confirm the risk and you'd treat  
6 it that way. Or if you don't see it at all, then you  
7 still don't know, correct?

8 A. I would ---

9 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

10 THE WITNESS: I would never perform an  
11 ultrasound for a patient that declined that care.

12 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So you agree, though, that the  
13 current status of the ACOG, based on bulletin 193, is  
14 that patients should be considered at risk for ectopic  
15 pregnancy and should be screened using ultrasound and  
16 possibly also serum hCG and history and other  
17 screenings, but at least ultrasound to determine  
18 whether they have an ectopic pregnancy?

19 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

20 THE WITNESS: Again, according to ACOG  
21 in this bulletin that was published in 2018, I -- I'm  
22 not aware that the -- I don't know what the schedule  
23 of review of this practice bulletin is, but I agree  
24 that this practice bulletin from 2018 says that hCG  
25 values may be helpful when used in conjunction with

1 patient history, symptoms and potentially ultrasound  
2 findings for people at risk of ectopic pregnancy.

3 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Well, it doesn't say -- so you  
4 added, "and potentially." It doesn't say, "and  
5 potentially." It actually says, "and ultrasound  
6 findings," right?

7 A. It does.

8 Q. Okay. So it's including ultrasound in that  
9 process of screening a patient to determine whether  
10 you can rule in or rule out the ectopic pregnancy  
11 risk, correct?

12 A. As of 2018, that's what -- you know, the  
13 sentence says, "patient's history, symptoms, and  
14 ultrasound findings."

15 Q. And again, I'm not trying to exclude or  
16 diminish even your research. I've read it. I  
17 understand it exists. However, there is some  
18 scientific support for conducting an ultrasound with a  
19 patient based on this ACOG 193 bulletin. Wouldn't you  
20 agree?

21 A. There is for people at risk of ectopic  
22 pregnancy, again, in this -- this paragraph that we're  
23 discussing as part of -- as part of this practice  
24 bulletin, for people at risk of ectopic pregnancy,  
25 then hCG findings "should be correlated with patient's

1 history, symptoms, and ultrasound findings." That's  
2 what the practice bulletin says.

3 Q. Which you would agree provides some support  
4 for having an ultrasound to rule out or rule in that  
5 particular risk on every woman's differential  
6 diagnosis when she tests positive for pregnancy?

7 A. The practice ---

8 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

9 THE WITNESS: The practice bulletin,  
10 again, is a starting point. And for the -- you know,  
11 when it's published, the best guidance that we have at  
12 that time for how to guide care for people within the  
13 obstetrics and gynecology practice.

14 Now, again, for each individual patient, I'm  
15 going to take that guidance and apply it to their  
16 specific characteristics and patient experience and  
17 then tailor that guidance based on the individual in  
18 front of me.

19 Q. (Mr. Boyle) I understand that and  
20 appreciate it and agree that's almost certainly  
21 appropriate ---

22 A. That, I would argue, is the standard of care  
23 that we've been -- been discussing.

24 Q. Okay. Very good.

25 I asked you earlier -- you've read the

1 Planned Parenthood South Atlantic documents that they  
2 provide to their patients related to informed consent  
3 for chemical abortion and for surgical abortion,  
4 haven't you?

5 A. I have not -- I have not read those  
6 documents, no.

7 Q. Okay. So if those documents inform a  
8 patient that is there to obtain a chemical abortion  
9 that they may have severe cramping and severe bleeding  
10 for several weeks, would you agree that those are  
11 similar symptoms that a patient who has a ruptured  
12 ectopic pregnancy might face?

13 A. If you're asking me to comment on specific  
14 documents, I'd have to review those.

15 Q. Well, I'm asking you a question. If a  
16 patient is told, "After you have the chemical  
17 abortion, the two-drug regime, you may experience  
18 heavy bleeding for even several weeks and blood clots  
19 the size of a lemon, and" -- you would agree that that  
20 patient could experience those symptoms but actually  
21 have a ruptured ectopic pregnancy and not be able to  
22 distinguish between having a ruptured ectopic  
23 pregnancy versus what the symptoms described as heavy  
24 bleeding were?

25 A. In my practice, we would counsel a person

1 about the main signs and symptoms of both ectopic  
2 pregnancy and induced abortion with medications so  
3 that they could really be in -- you know, the best in  
4 tune to their body and know when to access our 24-hour  
5 assistance line for assistance and help and -- and  
6 guidance if they were not sure if they needed it or if  
7 they thought they needed it.

8 Q. But you agree that the symptoms of a  
9 ruptured ectopic pregnancy can include things like bad  
10 pain in your abdomen, cramping and heavy bleeding,  
11 right?

12 A. The symptom -- what a person might  
13 experience with a ruptured ectopic pregnancy is  
14 typically different than the experience in the -- in  
15 the vast majority of cases for patients who access  
16 medication abortion.

17 Q. You say, "typically different," but they can  
18 be at least similar, right?

19 A. So the -- the symptoms that someone might  
20 have with an ectopic pregnancy are typically  
21 different.

22 Q. I -- I understand, typically they are  
23 different. But sometimes they're similar and could  
24 very well overlap. Is that correct?

25 A. The -- the symptoms a person might

1 experience with a ruptured ectopic pregnancy is going  
2 to be severe pain, typically unilaterally. They may  
3 experience pain with deep inspiration. They may  
4 experience lightheaded and dizziness.

5 They -- you know, it's not a typical  
6 experience of a person with ectopic pregnancy to have  
7 significant heavy bleeding noticeable on a pad, for  
8 example.

9 Q. I missed that last part. Can you -- can you  
10 say that -- I got confused.

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. I thought you were talking about the  
13 chemical abortion. Were you talking about the  
14 ectopic?

15 A. A person with ectopic pregnancy may have  
16 some bleeding, but it's typically not very heavy when  
17 -- you know, when they're assessing the amount of  
18 bleeding they're having, like if they had a pad in  
19 their underwear.

20 Q. And -- well, you haven't looked at the  
21 Planned Parenthood for South Atlantic's documents that  
22 they produced in this case related to their informed  
23 consent. Is that correct?

24 A. I have not reviewed any Planned Parenthood  
25 South Atlantic documents, no.

1 Q. Okay. You don't know what the Planned  
2 Parenthood South Atlantic's protocol is for screening  
3 patients for ectopic pregnancy before performing a  
4 chemical abortion on them, do you?

5 A. Again, because -- in order to be an  
6 affiliate of the federation, I know that extensive  
7 protocols must be in place to continue to be an  
8 affiliate. So I know they have one. I just don't  
9 know the specific details of that.

10 Q. And I accept that you believe they exist,  
11 and I -- I think they do too. I haven't seen them.  
12 But more to the point, you have not seen them,  
13 correct?

14 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

15 THE WITNESS: I have not seen any  
16 documents that Planned Parenthood South Atlantic uses.

17 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So you are unable to form any  
18 opinions about what Planned Parenthood South  
19 Atlantic's protocols are based on your review of those  
20 because you haven't reviewed them. Is that fair?

21 A. I haven't reviewed the documents. But  
22 again, because I'm an employee of Planned Parenthood  
23 North Central States, I understand the requirements  
24 that are necessary to continue to participate in the  
25 federation and continue to be a Planned Parenthood

1 site. So I know they exist. I just haven't seen the  
2 details of the specific documents.

3 Q. When is the typical gestational age of a  
4 pregnancy that you find yourself providing care to  
5 patients in your role in Minnesota?

6 A. Can you -- can you repeat the question,  
7 please?

8 Q. So you see patients who are testing positive  
9 for pregnancy. What's the typical earliest time that  
10 you will see that patient? Is it two weeks  
11 gestational age? Is it eight weeks gestational age,  
12 somewhere in between?

13 A. When they first make an appointment with me?

14 Q. When you see them, yes.

15 A. Oh, it can vary very widely.

16 Q. Do you typically -- do you agree that  
17 typically a woman wouldn't know that she is pregnant  
18 until four or five weeks gestational age just based on  
19 last menstrual cycle, et cetera?

20 A. The reason that the medical community uses  
21 and dates a pregnancy from the last menstrual period  
22 dates back from when we didn't have sophisticated  
23 ultrasound -- ultrasonography capacity. And,  
24 therefore, a person's first missed period would be a  
25 first sign for a person that they may be pregnant.



1 Q. Okay. So when you typically see patients  
2 that are early on, do you ever see patients that have  
3 a gestational age pregnancy of two or three weeks, or  
4 is it typically after five weeks gestational age?

5 A. I think, you know, people who -- once they  
6 realize they're pregnant and know they need to proceed  
7 with abortion care, they often call as soon as they  
8 can.

9 Q. I appreciate that and I don't dispute it.  
10 But what's your practical experience as, like, what's  
11 the gestational age when that happens?

12 A. Again, it's varied. Anywhere from -- I  
13 mean, a -- a person can make an appointment related to  
14 a pregnancy at any -- at any gestation that -- that  
15 they would prefer.

16 Some people, once they have that positive  
17 test, know they need to become -- that they need  
18 abortion care. So I've seen people in the -- in the  
19 third week of pregnancy, for example.

20 Q. Okay. And that's what I was asking. And so  
21 would you say third week of pregnancy is the earliest  
22 you've ever encountered a patient under those  
23 circumstances?

24 A. Probably.

25 Q. And ---

1           A.    I don't write those -- I don't write them  
2 down, so I don't -- I don't -- probably.

3           Q.    Have you ever provided an induced abortion  
4 to a patient who had a gestational age of less than  
5 five or six weeks?

6           A.    Yes.

7           Q.    When do you expect to be able to see a fetus  
8 or an embryo of one of your pregnant patients on an  
9 ultrasound?

10          A.    General consensus about that is we -- if a  
11 person accepts a transvaginal ultrasonography, then we  
12 would expect to see a gestational sac starting as  
13 early as five weeks.

14          Q.    Would you agree that it would be safer to  
15 confirm the intrauterine location of a pregnancy than  
16 to not know if it's an ectopic pregnancy using  
17 ultrasound when you're treating your patient?

18          A.    I'm not sure I missed -- I think I missed  
19 the last part of that. Can you ask that again?

20          Q.    When you're treating a pregnant patient,  
21 wouldn't you agree that it's safer for that patient to  
22 use ultrasound to rule in or rule out ectopic  
23 pregnancy before you provide that patient with a  
24 chemical abortion?

25          A.    For a patient who we have assessed as low

1 risk for an ectopic pregnancy, no.

2 Q. Have you ever had a patient that you  
3 assessed as low risk for an ectopic pregnancy, you  
4 performed an induced abortion on that patient, and  
5 then later that patient turned out to have an ectopic  
6 pregnancy?

7 A. Okay. Say that one more time.

8 Q. Have you ever had a situation where you  
9 screened a patient, your screening process determined  
10 that the patient was low risk for ectopic pregnancy so  
11 you did not perform an ultrasound on that patient, you  
12 gave that patient a chemical abortion, and then later  
13 you found out that that patient had an ectopic  
14 pregnancy?

15 A. I'd have to -- I'd have to go back and look  
16 specifically at the -- the only time where that would  
17 have occurred -- I'm not sure. I'd have to go back  
18 and look.

19 Q. You can't say definitively that that's never  
20 happened?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. And so you agree that there's a risk that,  
23 even if you determine a patient is low risk, they  
24 might have an ectopic pregnancy, right?

25 A. So I think, you know, the important thing

1 when we're counseling a person who's sitting in front  
2 of us requesting pregnancy care, including induced  
3 abortion care, is to review all of the risks, yeah.

4 So we go through those with the person, and  
5 then the patient accepts or does not accept those  
6 risks and decides for themselves how to proceed during  
7 that encounter.

8 Q. Would you be able to look back through your  
9 records and determine whether you had a patient that  
10 you screened, found that patient to be low risk for  
11 ectopic pregnancy, you did not provide them with a --  
12 you did not take an ultrasound of that patient, you  
13 did provide them with a chemical abortion, and then  
14 afterwards they showed up as having an ectopic  
15 pregnancy?

16 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

17 THE WITNESS: I could certainly look  
18 for that information. I think it ultimately is  
19 irrational to require that for every patient for these  
20 very, very rare instances even if that occurred in my  
21 practice.

22 Q. (Mr. Boyle) You used the word "irrational."  
23 Are you using that word because of the lawsuit? Is  
24 that why?

25 A. I'm using that word -- I don't know. It's

1 just the word I chose.

2 Q. Okay. You're not trying to couch it in  
3 terms of the law or the lawsuit when you say  
4 irrational?

5 A. I'm not an attorney, so I don't -- I don't  
6 know.

7 Q. Okay. Were you able to confirm that that  
8 patient who you saw at gestational age three weeks was  
9 pregnant?

10 A. (No audible answer)

11 Q. You mentioned earlier the earliest that you  
12 had treated a patient -- a pregnant patient was three  
13 weeks gestational age, right?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. How were you able to confirm that patient  
16 was three weeks gestational age pregnancy?

17 A. The patient reported a sure last menstrual  
18 period, a history of regular, predictable menstrual  
19 cycles that lasted -- that were consistent with, you  
20 know, the -- her history of menstrual cycles, so we  
21 were able to date the pregnancy that way.

22 And this particular patient that I'm  
23 thinking about also had a urine pregnancy test in our  
24 health center.

25 Q. Did you perform an ultrasound on that

1 patient?

2 A. I mean, again, I -- it's my -- it's our  
3 standard practice to go through a protocol of  
4 history-based screening to determine whether or not we  
5 need to recommend an ultrasound for a person.

6 Q. You agree that induced abortion of any type  
7 is more complicated after the unborn child reaches the  
8 second trimester, don't you?

9 A. I'm -- I guess I'm not clear what you're  
10 asking.

11 Q. Complications for induced abortions  
12 increase, the risks increase the older the gestational  
13 age, so when you get to the second trimester it is  
14 more risky to perform an induced abortion in the  
15 second trimester than the first trimester. Is that  
16 correct?

17 A. Comparing a procedural abortion in the  
18 second trimester to a procedural abortion in the first  
19 trimester, yes, the risks are -- the risk, generally,  
20 for a procedural abortion increases as the gestation  
21 of the pregnancy increases. That would also be true  
22 for a person who decided to continue their pregnancy.

23 Q. Do you agree with the Academy of Medicine's  
24 article you cited from extensively when it says that,  
25 "The risk of serious complication increases with weeks

1 gestation. As the number of weeks increase, the  
2 invasiveness of the required procedures and the need  
3 for deeper levels of sedation also increase"?

4 A. Again, I'd have to review the specific  
5 portion of that document that you're, you know,  
6 alluding to to determine whether or not I agree with  
7 that. I think, generally speaking, you know, the  
8 academy didn't -- yeah, I'll just stop there.

9 Q. Do you agree with this statement: "The risk  
10 of serious complication increases with weeks  
11 gestation. As the number of weeks increase, the  
12 invasiveness of the required surgical procedure for an  
13 abortion and the need for deeper levels of sedation  
14 also increase"?

15 A. That was kind of a lot of things there. So  
16 generally, you know, as a person who doesn't -- you  
17 know, who recognizes the invasive nature of just  
18 having a pelvic exam, I don't -- I don't know exactly  
19 what the invasive portion means in that, that you're  
20 referring to. But generally, the -- again, for a  
21 procedural abortion, as the pregnancy advances, the  
22 risk -- the risk can increase.

23 Q. After 11 weeks gestational age, you don't  
24 perform a chemical abortion, right?

25 A. Not after 77 days.

1 Q. So every induced abortion ---

2 A. Or, I -- I'm sorry, let me -- can I ---

3 Q. Okay.

4 A. Sorry to interrupt.

5 Q. Sure.

6 A. Not -- in the first trimester, no, not after  
7 the -- after 77 days. If a person wanted induction  
8 termination abortion in my practice, then we would  
9 provide that.

10 Q. And the induction chemical abortion that you  
11 described earlier where you use more of the chemical  
12 drugs -- a higher dose, I should say, that's beyond  
13 the FDA-approved usage of those drugs also, isn't it?

14 A. When we're taking care of a patient for an  
15 induction termination in the second trimester, we use  
16 the medications off-label.

17 Q. And I think you said that you start using  
18 D&E abortion after 17 weeks. Is that correct?

19 A. Generally starting in the 17th week.

20 Q. Okay. So leading up to week 16, you would  
21 -- if you were doing a surgical abortion, it would be  
22 an aspiration abortion. Is that correct?

23 A. The vast majority of times, yes.

24 Q. And you would agree that the simple act of  
25 placing forceps and surgical tools repeatedly beyond



1 the cervix into the uterus increases the risk of both  
2 a cervical laceration and uterine perforation,  
3 wouldn't you?

4 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

5 THE WITNESS: I don't -- I don't think  
6 I'm aware of any specific data showing a specific  
7 number of times that a person may need to pass a  
8 forceps to complete the dilation and evacuation as a  
9 known increased risk.

10 Q. (Mr. Boyle) So you don't think anybody's  
11 studied that?

12 A. I'm not aware of a study. That doesn't mean  
13 that it doesn't exist.

14 Q. You agree that sometimes patients who  
15 undergo surgical abortions need to have a blood  
16 transfusion as a complication of that procedure, don't  
17 you?

18 A. Yes. I'm aware that pregnant people need  
19 transfusions, including those, occasionally, that  
20 access induced abortion.

21 Q. Have you ever had one of your patients who  
22 you were performing a surgical abortion, either an  
23 aspiration or a D&E abortion, at the Planned  
24 Parenthood clinic that needed a blood transfusion  
25 during or soon after the procedure?

1 A. No.

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. Not to my knowledge.

4 Q. You agree that some, at least some,  
5 second-trimester induced abortions must occur in a  
6 hospital setting, don't you?

7 A. There are certain characteristics either  
8 associated with the pregnancy or associated with the  
9 patient that may make hospital-based care a  
10 recommendation.

11 Q. And about -- from my reading of your CV,  
12 about half of the second-trimester abortions that you  
13 perform, you perform in the hospital setting. Is that  
14 correct?

15 A. That information wouldn't be listed on my  
16 CV.

17 Q. Is it correct?

18 A. It's not correct.

19 Q. How many of the second-trimester abortions  
20 that you -- procedural, surgical abortions that you  
21 perform, what's the percentage breakdown of the ones  
22 that you do in the hospital setting versus in the  
23 Planned Parenthood clinic setting?

24 A. Again, speaking generally, I don't --  
25 generally, sorry. I'm going to keep -- stop mumbling

1 for the transcript. Sorry.

2 So I provide dilation and evacuation  
3 abortion at both the hospital and Planned Parenthood  
4 North Central States. The exact numbers of -- numbers  
5 of patients I take care of at Planned Parenthood  
6 versus number of patients I take care of at the  
7 university, I don't have at the ready or in my brain.

8 The amount of time I spend, you know,  
9 providing procedural abortion at both of those  
10 locations, right, the university would be about a half  
11 day per week and Planned Parenthood would be about one  
12 full day per week.

13 Q. Okay. So would you say one-third of the --  
14 well, let me ask before I go to that. When you say a  
15 half day at the hospital and a full day at the clinic,  
16 is that full day at the clinic focused solely on  
17 second-trimester surgical abortions?

18 A. No.

19 Q. What else do you do in that time when you're  
20 at the clinic?

21 A. When I'm providing care at the health center  
22 here in St. Paul, I -- we assess people for their need  
23 for whatever they make a -- an appointment for,  
24 honestly. So I provide medication abortion. I  
25 provide procedural abortion in the first and second

1 trimester. I assess people for management of  
2 miscarriage. I assess people for other pregnancy  
3 symptoms they may have in the first trimester.

4 Q. Okay. And as it relates to the hospital  
5 setting, that half day, is it not true that primarily  
6 what you're doing there are second-trimester surgical  
7 abortions?

8 A. I mean, the bulk of my procedural abortion  
9 care at the university is in the second trimester,  
10 yes.

11 Q. Okay. And ---

12 A. But it's not all -- it's not all that I do  
13 in the operating room.

14 Q. Okay. So taking just the second-trimester  
15 surgical abortions that you perform in the hospital  
16 and in the clinic, are they not roughly equal amounts  
17 at each place?

18 A. Again, I can only really tell you what the  
19 -- the amount of time that I spend at both of those  
20 places. I'd have to look at specific numbers to say  
21 anything about specific numbers.

22 Q. You're not able to just give a rough  
23 percentage based on you doing all of them yourself and  
24 knowing what that would be?

25 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

1 THE WITNESS: I do many procedures, and  
2 there's no way I can keep them all in my head ---

3 MR. BOYLE: Okay.

4 THE WITNESS: --- regardless of whether  
5 it's for abortion or another obstetric and gynecologic  
6 problem.

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) In any event, you do many  
8 second-trimester surgical abortions in a hospital  
9 setting every week. Is that fair?

10 A. It depends on what you define as many.

11 Q. More than five?

12 A. No.

13 Q. How many would you say you do on a weekly  
14 basis in the hospital setting?

15 A. Somewhere probably between one and four.

16 Q. Okay. Sorry, I'm closing out things, I've  
17 jumped around a little bit.

18 A. That's okay.

19 Q. Does the hospital where you work in  
20 Minnesota and you see patient -- pregnant patients to  
21 give them surgical abortions, does that hospital  
22 provide staff training for dealing with those types of  
23 patients and for patients who have survived sexual  
24 assaults?

25 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

1 THE WITNESS: We -- I -- you know, I  
2 can't know what detailed training is required for all  
3 levels of staff that work in the hospital, so I'm not  
4 sure I can comment authoritatively on that question.

5 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you feel like the staff you  
6 work with at the hospital when you bring your patients  
7 to the hospital and perform abortions on them, do you  
8 feel like the hospital staff is adequately trained to  
9 react and deal with those patients?

10 A. I'm very privileged to work in a hospital  
11 that is very supportive of people's access of -- to  
12 comprehensive reproductive healthcare. My -- I have  
13 the feeling that many nurses, especially in the  
14 preoperative area, actually choose to work there and  
15 continue to work there because we're able to provide  
16 abortion care in the hospital.

17 Q. So you think that about your hospital in  
18 Minnesota, but you ---

19 A. I do.

20 Q. --- made or you gave opinions about the  
21 hospital staff in North Carolina. Do you recall that?

22 A. I do not.

23 Q. You don't recall saying that you think that  
24 the hospital staff in North Carolina aren't trained to  
25 properly deal with patients who are having abortion --

1 surgical abortion procedures?

2 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

3 THE WITNESS: If you're referring to  
4 statements I made in my declaration, I'm happy to  
5 review that document in that specific area that  
6 you're, you know, discussing.

7 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Well, you don't remember saying  
8 that in your declaration that you provided in this  
9 case?

10 A. What I know to be true is that staff at  
11 Planned Parenthood are required to do extensive  
12 training at least annually, in my Planned Parenthood,  
13 at least annually to review how -- you know, sensitive  
14 exams and how to be present with a person that has  
15 experienced sexual assault. What I don't know is  
16 whether or not that's required for all staff at the  
17 hospital.

18 Q. And you're talking about at your hospital in  
19 Minnesota, right?

20 A. I am. Uh-huh (yes).

21 Q. And you don't know ---

22 A. And I certainly -- if I don't work at a  
23 place, I certainly wouldn't know the exact specifics  
24 that are required for all staff at any hospital in  
25 North Carolina. I'm sure the -- that differs greatly.

1 Q. Well, you cut me off, because that's where I  
2 was going.

3 A. Sorry.

4 Q. It's okay. I'm kidding.

5 Yeah, I just -- I just wanted to point out  
6 that you don't even know what the training is at your  
7 Minnesota hospital, so you don't have any opinions  
8 about what the training is for staff at any North  
9 Carolina hospital. Is that fair to say?

10 A. Oh, no, I have -- well, again, I can tell  
11 you from my experience in sitting with patients that,  
12 generally, people are much more prepared to sit with a  
13 person who's experienced sexual assault in my setting  
14 at Planned Parenthood than they are in the hospital.

15 Now, I'm not saying that the nurses who  
16 staff preoperative area are going to try to be  
17 disrespectful to a person that experienced or  
18 discloses that they've been a survivor of sexual  
19 assault, because, generally, I think the people who  
20 work there are pretty good people. But I'm not aware  
21 of any specific training that's required for them to  
22 be able to continue their job.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. That also doesn't mean -- well, yeah. Never  
25 mind.



1 MR. BOYLE: Give me just a moment here.

2 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Let me ask you about the  
3 Goldberg study. Do you remember citing that?

4 A. I do.

5 Q. That's from 2022. He did a -- they -- he's  
6 the lead author, but they did a retrospective cohort  
7 study of medical records from Massachusetts Planned  
8 Parenthood entities related to giving chemical  
9 abortion drugs to a patient with a pregnancy of  
10 unknown location. Is that right?

11 A. Yes. My recollection of the Goldberg study  
12 was that they looked backwards, so retrospectively, at  
13 care that had already happened that they had provided  
14 for patients who presented for induced abortion care,  
15 were diagnosed with a pregnancy of unknown location  
16 and then requested medication abortion.

17 Q. And do you recall that 26 of -- well, so  
18 there were -- some part of the population decided to  
19 delay care and another smaller portion decided to go  
20 ahead and take the chemical abortion before there was  
21 a specific location of the pregnancy using ultrasound.  
22 Is that your recollection?

23 A. My recollection of that study is that there  
24 were two groups of people that they, again, sorted  
25 retrospectively that presented for care -- for

1 abortion care, were diagnosed with a pregnancy of  
2 unknown location, and then based on specific patient  
3 factors or counseling or the patient's own assessment  
4 of the best -- best way to proceed for them, either  
5 chose expectant management with close follow-up or  
6 proceeding on that day with induced abortion with  
7 medication and close follow-up.

8 Q. Okay. So do you recall that of the group  
9 that delayed care, that decided not to have a surgical  
10 or chemical abortion when they were initially told  
11 that they had a pregnancy of unknown location, do you  
12 recall that 26 percent of those patients who delayed  
13 care never needed to take the chemical abortion drugs  
14 at all because they either had an ectopic pregnancy or  
15 an early loss of pregnancy without any medication?

16 A. I'd have to ---

17 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

18 THE WITNESS: Sorry, Kara.

19 I'd have to see the specific article to  
20 comment on specific percentages.

21 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. If in fact that's what  
22 it said and it was 26 percent that did not need --  
23 that delayed care, that did not need the chemical  
24 abortion drugs for those two reasons, because they  
25 either lost the pregnancy or they had an ectopic

1 pregnancy, if you extrapolate that to the patient  
2 population at large, that would mean that basically  
3 one out of four patients who have a pregnancy of  
4 unknown location would end up not needing to have the  
5 chemical abortion drugs. Do you agree with that?

6 A. I do not.

7 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

8 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Why not?

9 A. I do not. Because that patient population,  
10 again, considering patient factors, patient history,  
11 patient's prior access, patient's own assessment of  
12 what is happening in their body, a good number of  
13 those people chose to remain in the  
14 delay-for-diagnosis group.

15 So again, blanket statements like that  
16 aren't honoring the fact that we do a very detailed  
17 assessment of patients' history and counsel them about  
18 their options. And in this study, you know, there  
19 were people who chose to -- you know, to proceed with  
20 expectant management.

21 Part of the reason that a patient might  
22 choose that management strategy is that they already  
23 think they're having a miscarriage. So I think that's  
24 probably more representative of -- of a portion of  
25 that group which they described "delay-for-diagnosis"

1 in their study.

2 Q. Did you include a delay-for-diagnosis cohort  
3 in your study from 2022?

4 A. Are you referring to my study from 2023?

5 Q. I'm sorry. Yeah, it was published in 2023,  
6 yes.

7 A. So our -- again, in our setting, our  
8 standard protocol for how to proceed when patients are  
9 diagnosed with a pregnancy of unknown location is to  
10 consider all the options for the patient. So that  
11 includes a detailed history, an assessment of a  
12 person's risk for ectopic pregnancy, and then also  
13 their own, you know, kind of collation of all that  
14 information about how they want to proceed.

15 So there are certainly patients in our  
16 setting and, you know -- I presume you've read or at  
17 least skimmed the article -- you know, we showed that  
18 that -- patients -- that our protocol for how we do  
19 that provides that care safely.

20 Q. Did you study a cohort that delayed after  
21 there was a pregnancy of unknown location -- or I'm  
22 sorry, after the -- well, yeah. After there was no  
23 ultrasound and you didn't know the location of the  
24 pregnancy, did you study a delayed cohort to see what  
25 happened to them?

1           A.     In our 2023 study, all the patients had been  
2 diagnosed with a pregnancy of unknown location.

3           Q.     Right. And ---

4           A.     And some of those patients -- again,  
5 retrospectively, right? Some of those patients, you  
6 know, collating all the information that we go through  
7 with and the counseling we provide on the day of the  
8 encounter, chose to proceed with expectant management  
9 with close follow-up.

10          Q.     Chose to have a chemical abortion, is that  
11 what you mean by that when ---

12          A.     The other option ---

13                   MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form. Go  
14 ahead.

15                   THE WITNESS: The other option for a  
16 person diagnosed with a pregnancy of unknown location  
17 that's deemed low risk for ectopic pregnancy in our  
18 setting would include proceeding with medication  
19 abortion or a procedural abortion.

20          Q.     (Mr. Boyle) And what was the first one you  
21 were describing? I missed that, I'm sorry.

22          A.     Yeah. So if a patient comes into our health  
23 center requesting an abortion or made an abortion  
24 appointment and we diagnose a pregnancy of unknown  
25 location, then from there we do, you know, a detailed

1 assessment in correlation or in combination to assess  
2 a person's risk for ectopic pregnancy.

3 There are certain, you know, factors and  
4 patient-level characteristics that may make a person  
5 high risk for ectopic pregnancy. And then we have  
6 extensive protocols about how to ensure that patient  
7 gets referred out for sometimes, you know, same-day  
8 care or close follow-up with their -- with -- to, you  
9 know, kind of on -- continue to assess that risk.

10 Q. Okay. So did you study pregnancy of unknown  
11 location with three groups, one group that got  
12 chemical abortion, one group that got surgical  
13 abortion and then one group that delayed care and  
14 waited until they could confirm the location of the  
15 pregnancy?

16 A. Yes. Our study in 2023 included three  
17 groups. Patients chose -- after being diagnosed with  
18 pregnancy of unknown location and then assessed to be  
19 low risk for ectopic pregnancy, those patients chose  
20 either expectant management with close follow-up,  
21 medication abortion with close follow-up or procedural  
22 abortion for -- with close follow-up.

23 Q. And did some of those who chose expectant  
24 management with close follow-up turn out to have a  
25 loss of pregnancy or an ectopic pregnancy?

1           A.    I'd have to look at the specific numbers in  
2   the article. But again, one of the reasons -- after  
3   counseling a person that's diagnosed with a pregnancy  
4   of unknown location, some of that is because the  
5   patient has had bleeding and suspects that they have  
6   had a miscarriage already. And we just can't know  
7   that with a single time point at a single encounter.

8           Q.    So did some of those people who delayed  
9   their care end up having an ectopic pregnancy or  
10  having an early loss of pregnancy without any induced  
11  abortion?

12          A.    I'd have to look at the specifics, but I  
13  think, again, because ectopic pregnancy, you know, is  
14  a part of early pregnancy, I -- I'm pretty sure there  
15  were ectopic pregnancies eventually diagnosed in all  
16  of the groups.

17               MS. GRANDIN: Pardon my interruption.  
18  I was just wondering if we could get a time check from  
19  you, Gretchen. Per my calculation, we're pretty close  
20  to four hours.

21               MR. BOYLE: I agree we are and I've got  
22  about two or three questions left. So if that's all  
23  right, I'll just proceed, but I'm not going much  
24  longer.

25               MS. GRANDIN: Okay. That sounds good.

1 MR. BOYLE: Okay.

2 MS. GRANDIN: Thank you.

3 MR. BOYLE: Thanks.

4 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Do you recall that the Goldberg  
5 study concluded that waiting to provide chemical  
6 abortion drugs until a patient has a confirmed  
7 intrauterine pregnancy is reasonably safe and  
8 effective?

9 A. That's not -- I mean, that's not the primary  
10 -- that's not my recollection of the primary  
11 conclusion that they drew from their study.

12 Q. Do you recall that it was at least a  
13 conclusion that he -- that they drew from their study?

14 A. I'd have to look specifically. You know,  
15 the conclusion that I recollected from that study was  
16 that providing abortion care for patients diagnosed  
17 with pregnancy of unknown location is safe and  
18 effective.

19 Q. Do you agree, though, that waiting to  
20 provide chemical abortion drugs until a patient has a  
21 confirmed intrauterine pregnancy is reasonably safe  
22 and effective?

23 A. I think, again, that doesn't honor patient  
24 experience very well. I think when we have a -- a  
25 perfectly safe and effective way to provide abortion



1 care in the setting of a pregnancy of unknown  
2 location, I think it's -- I think it's rather cruel to  
3 make a person wait.

4 MR. BOYLE: I don't think I have any  
5 further questions. Some of these other folks may have  
6 some. Doctor, I very much appreciate your time today.  
7 Thank you.

8 THE WITNESS: Indeed. I appreciate  
9 yours as well.

10 MS. GRANDIN: Do you mind if we take  
11 about ten minutes, and I might come up -- come back  
12 with a couple re-direct questions?

13 THE COURT REPORTER: Off the record at  
14 2:58 p.m.

15 (Brief recess: 2:58 p.m. to 3:11 p.m.)

16 THE COURT REPORTER: Back on the record  
17 at 3:11 p.m.

18 EXAMINATION

19 BY MS. GRANDIN:

20 Q. Dr. Boraas, in your experience when a  
21 patient is seeking an abortion involving some level of  
22 sedation, who makes the decision about what level of  
23 sedation to give a patient?

24 A. You know, ultimately, it's the patient's  
25 decision.

1 Q. Does the anesthesiologist ever make that  
2 decision?

3 A. I would say the anesthesiologist strongly  
4 recommends a specific type of anesthesia, if there's  
5 an ---

6 Q. In your ---

7 A. --- if there's an anesthesiologist involved.

8 Q. In your experience, what factors often go  
9 into making the decision of what level of sedation a  
10 patient prefers?

11 A. Well, the first and foremost is what the  
12 patient desires. The second is, you know,  
13 occasionally we will see a patient that just requires  
14 a high -- a high level of sedation in order to  
15 complete the procedure safely.

16 Q. In your experience providing abortions, how  
17 often do patients choose deep sedation as their  
18 sedation option?

19 A. Well, again, the only place where people  
20 would have that -- would be able to access deep  
21 sedation would be in the hospital. And for various  
22 reasons, namely, the first and foremost being  
23 insurance coverage, that's a prohibitive option for  
24 many people in my setting.

25 Q. Do you have a general estimation, or is that

1 just -- is that not something you'd be able to provide  
2 an estimate of?

3 A. Deep sedation compared to general  
4 anesthesia?

5 Q. Deep sedation compared to other options I --  
6 available.

7 A. Yeah, I think it really just depends on the  
8 patient. Many patients are nervous about any type of  
9 sedation and how it might affect their body.

10 Q. When a uterine perforation or a cervical  
11 laceration occurs during a procedural abortion, how do  
12 you generally treat that?

13 A. So treatment for both of those things is  
14 potentially different, so I'm going to talk about one  
15 at a time.

16 Q. Yes. Thank you.

17 A. No problem. If a perforation is suspected  
18 during a procedure, the next sort of -- not question,  
19 but the next thing that we assess is with what  
20 instrument because that -- that determines whether or  
21 not the patient -- whether or not we can ensure the  
22 integrity of the bowel.

23 If we can't ensure the integrity of the  
24 bowel, then the person has to have assessment of that  
25 surgically at the hospital.

1           If the perforation happens with a blunt  
2   instrument, especially in the first trimester, we're  
3   usually able to watch those patients closely in our  
4   outpatient health center, like at Planned Parenthood  
5   North Central States, and closely monitor vitals and  
6   pain level and just sort of overall patient  
7   assessment.

8           Sometimes potentially using ultrasound to --  
9   and sometimes we're also able to, you know, monitor  
10   the patient safety in our health center.

11          Q.    And I -- I think you answered this question  
12   in your general answer, but just to clarify. Does --  
13   in general, when a uterine perforation occurs, does it  
14   always require treatment in a hospital?

15          A.    No.

16          Q.    And when a cervical laceration -- sorry, go  
17   ahead.

18          A.    Yeah, sorry. I just remembered that you  
19   asked about cervical laceration, too, and I haven't  
20   answered that. So ---

21          Q.    That's okay. Let me -- let me ask the  
22   question again specifically to cervical laceration.  
23   So when a cervical laceration occurs during a  
24   procedural abortion, how do you treat that?

25          A.    It depends whether or not the -- the

1 laceration is low or in the distal portion of the  
2 cervix or whether it's higher and not as easily  
3 visible.

4 So for a distal or cervical laceration that  
5 occurs at the end of the cervix, those, if they're  
6 very small, can just be observed and make sure that  
7 they're not bleeding heavily. And if they're not,  
8 those can -- then those heal on their own.

9 If it's more -- if it's a slightly larger  
10 laceration or the laceration is bleeding a fair  
11 amount, then oftentimes we will reapproximate that  
12 laceration with suture, bring it together with suture  
13 and ensure that there isn't any ongoing bleeding.

14 Q. And ---

15 A. If ---

16 Q. Sorry, go ahead.

17 A. If the -- if the laceration is potentially  
18 higher, that may be treated with tamponade, like with  
19 a intrauterine balloon. And a fair number of times,  
20 that is sufficient for treatment of that. Higher  
21 lacerations sometimes need other procedures depending  
22 on where the -- where it is.

23 Q. So can a cervical laceration be treated  
24 safely in the clinic, an outpatient clinic where an  
25 abortion is performed?

1 A. Certain types of them, yes, absolutely.

2 Q. Does it -- is it always a requirement for  
3 surgical lacerations that the patient be treated in a  
4 hospital setting?

5 A. It is not always a requirement that cervical  
6 lacerations are better addressed in a hospital  
7 setting, no.

8 Q. Are forceps used in miscarriage management  
9 in your experience?

10 A. If I'm providing a dilation and evacuation  
11 to help complete a miscarriage for a patient, yes.  
12 Again, typically starting around the 17th week of  
13 pregnancy, that would be the same for a person  
14 experiencing a miscarriage also.

15 Q. Are forceps used in labor and delivery in  
16 your experience?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Is cervical ---

19 A. When a patient ---

20 Q. Sorry, go ahead.

21 A. Yeah. Yes, when a patient requires an  
22 operative vaginal delivery. Sometimes even at the  
23 time of C-section if the extraction is difficult.

24 Q. Is cervical laceration a possible  
25 complication of miscarriage management?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Is it a possible complication of labor and  
3 delivery?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Is uterine perforation a possible  
6 complication of miscarriage management?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Is it a possible complication of labor and  
9 delivery?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Is infection a possible complication of  
12 miscarriage management?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Is it a possible complication of labor and  
15 delivery?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is hemorrhage a possible ---  
18 (Off-record comments)

19 Q. (Ms. Grandin) Is hemorrhage a possible  
20 complication of miscarriage management?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Is it a possible complication of labor and  
23 delivery?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Does that include a hemorrhage requiring a

1 blood transfusion?

2 A. Hemorrhage requiring a blood transfusion is  
3 much more likely at the time of giving birth either  
4 vaginally or by a cesarean section than it would be  
5 for a person accessing induced abortion.

6 Q. In your opinion, do dilation and evacuation  
7 abortions need to be performed in a hospital in order  
8 to be performed safely?

9 A. No.

10 Q. So I think you testified earlier that you  
11 hadn't seen PPSAT's specific abortion protocols.  
12 However, you reviewed Dr. Farris's declaration  
13 submitted in support of the Amended Preliminary  
14 Injunction Motion in this case. Is that correct? Her  
15 two declarations?

16 A. I reviewed the declarations that Dr. Farris  
17 submitted, yes.

18 Q. What from Dr. Farris -- from your review of  
19 Dr. Farris's declaration, what is your understanding  
20 of PPSAT's protocol for a medication abortion in the  
21 circumstance where a patient has a pregnancy of  
22 unknown location?

23 A. From my review of Dr. Farris's declarations,  
24 the protocol at PPSAT would include assessment of  
25 patient's risk for ectopic pregnancy if they have been



1 diagnosed with a pregnancy of unknown location, and  
2 then a thorough review of the risks and benefits of  
3 expectant management in the setting of a PUL,  
4 pregnancy of unknown location, or proceeding with  
5 medication abortion or a procedural abortion.

6 And then my ---

7 Q. Do you -- sorry. Go ahead.

8 A. My -- again, from her declaration, my  
9 understanding of PPSAT's protocol regarding patients  
10 with a PUL also includes review of, you know,  
11 potential warning signs and symptoms associated with  
12 an ectopic pregnancy, as well as recommendation for  
13 very close follow-up.

14 Q. From your review of the -- Dr. Farris's  
15 declaration, do you understand that PPSAT in North  
16 Carolina uses hCG serial testing to evaluate patients  
17 who seek medication abortion but have a pregnancy of  
18 unknown location?

19 A. I do recall that from Dr. Farris's  
20 declaration.

21 Q. Do you recall whether PPSAT in North  
22 Carolina administers ultrasounds to patients who have  
23 a pregnancy of unknown location and seek medication  
24 abortion?

25 A. The only -- the only way to establish a

1 definitive diagnosis of pregnancy of unknown location  
2 is with ultrasonography. So, yes, if they're treating  
3 people with a pregnancy of unknown location, then they  
4 -- that person has had an ultrasound.

5 Q. Is it your understanding from Dr. Farris's  
6 declaration that PPSAT uses a similar protocol as the  
7 protocol whose safety and efficacy you discussed in  
8 your published research on the topic in your article  
9 from 2023 that we discussed previously in this  
10 deposition?

11 A. Our article does, in a box in the article,  
12 describe the protocol that we use here at Planned  
13 Parenthood North Central States. And it's -- from her  
14 declaration, the protocol that Dr. Farris described in  
15 the declarations seems very -- very similar.

16 MS. GRANDIN: Thank you, Dr. Boraas. I  
17 don't have any further questions.

18 MR. BOYLE: I have brief re-direct  
19 based on your questions if I might.

20 MS. GRANDIN: Okay.

21 THE WITNESS: Absolutely.

22 FURTHER EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. BOYLE:

24 Q. You were talking about bleeding from a  
25 cervical laceration. How do you see that? What

1 methodology do you use or mechanism do you use to  
2 visualize that? Do you just see it with your eyes, or  
3 are you using radiograph or some other testing?

4 A. Bleeding is visible with my eyes ---

5 Q. Okay. So you don't have like a fiber optic  
6 or something like that?

7 A. No. No fiber optics.

8 Q. Then how are you able to see it if it's --  
9 not distal, but if it's the other one, farther away?

10 A. We would suspect a high cervical laceration  
11 if there was ongoing bleeding that wasn't coming from  
12 the top portion or fundus of the uterus.

13 Q. Well, you said some cervical lacerations  
14 should be treated in a hospital setting, right?

15 A. I didn't say that. I said many cervical  
16 lacerations can be safely treated in an outpatient  
17 setting.

18 Q. Which means the rest must be treated in a  
19 hospital setting, right?

20 A. There are certain -- you know, there are  
21 certain high cervical lacerations that don't respond  
22 enough to the measures that we use to treat them in  
23 the outpatient center. And then for those people,  
24 they may require transfer to a hospital.

25 Q. And you said that some uterine perforations

1 require hospital exploratory -- exploratory surgery of  
2 the abdomen in a hospital setting, right?

3 A. Some -- depending on what instrument and  
4 where the perforation in the uterus occurs and the  
5 potential risk for injury to the bowel in particular,  
6 some of those patients, yeah, need to be transferred  
7 for -- if the D&E happens in the outpatient setting,  
8 need to be transferred for that surgery in a hospital.

9 Q. You don't do any exploratory abdominal  
10 surgery to determine the scope of damage to different  
11 organs from a uterine perforation in your Planned  
12 Parenthood clinic in Minnesota, do you?

13 A. We don't provide any intraabdominal surgery  
14 at Planned Parenthood North Central States, no.

15 Q. And I know you haven't ---

16 A. However, if I'm taking care of that patient  
17 and that perforation occurs in the hospital, I would  
18 be present as the physician responsible and likely  
19 probably even start the case while we requested, you  
20 know, intraoperative consultation from the general  
21 surgeon.

22 Q. Right. But you wouldn't do that at the  
23 clinic. You would transfer that patient from the  
24 clinic to the hospital before you started that  
25 surgery, right?

1           A.     That type of surgery requires general  
2 anesthesia, and we don't have that capacity at North  
3 -- Planned Parenthood North Central States.

4           Q.     How do you get the serum hCG test from a  
5 patient? What do you do to collect that?

6           A.     We draw their blood.

7           Q.     How do you draw their blood?

8           A.     With a needle.

9           Q.     So do you take hCG testing of every patient  
10 before you give them a chemical abortion drug?

11          A.     Not all patients accessing medication  
12 abortion need serum beta hCG testing.

13          Q.     So is it your testimony that you have  
14 patients that you give chemical abortion drugs to that  
15 have neither had an ultrasound to confirm the location  
16 of the pregnancy nor had a serum hCG blood draw to  
17 test their pregnancy amounts, if you will?

18                   MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form.

19                   THE WITNESS: Testing serum hCG  
20 pregnancy amounts isn't really a thing in medical  
21 practice. The absolute value is rarely of helpful  
22 significance. It's really the trend over time that  
23 helps us take good, safe care of patients.

24                   Now, there are certainly patients who  
25 screened, you know, after a thorough assessment to be

1 low risk for ectopic pregnancy and would need neither  
2 an ultrasound nor serum hCG testing.

3 Q. (Mr. Boyle) Okay. So in your practice in  
4 Minnesota at your Planned Parenthood clinic, you give  
5 patients -- on certain occasions, you give them  
6 chemical abortion drugs without performing an  
7 ultrasound on them or drawing blood to conduct the  
8 first in a series of serum hCG blood tests. Is that  
9 correct?

10 A. The provision of medication abortion without  
11 -- after a history-based screening without ultrasound  
12 or tests like serum hCG is well established in the  
13 medical literature to be safe and effective.

14 Q. And you do that at your clinic in the  
15 Planned Parenthood clinic in Minnesota. Is that  
16 correct?

17 A. For patients who screen out of the need for  
18 ultrasound, yes.

19 Q. And even if they don't have an ultrasound,  
20 you also sometimes don't have either an ultrasound or  
21 the blood draw, correct?

22 A. Those two things are not indicated for every  
23 medication abortion patient.

24 Q. Which is sort of the inverse of what I'm  
25 asking. So sometimes, you give those patients who

1 don't have an ultrasound and don't have the serum  
2 blood draw, you give them chemical abortion drugs. Is  
3 that correct?

4 A. If they are deemed to be a low-risk patient  
5 and have -- and that's what they choose as far as  
6 prevent -- proceeding with abortion care and are able  
7 to, you know, say that they'll, you know, complete the  
8 recommended follow-up.

9 Q. I feel like you left a yes off at the end  
10 there. Was there a yes that -- if all those things,  
11 then, yes, you do that?

12 A. If all those -- if all of those things are  
13 true about a individual in front of me, then yes.

14 Q. Okay. Lawyers are fun, aren't we?

15 A. You -- yeah, you all are fun.

16 Q. So -- and just so I understood your  
17 testimony before with Ms. Grandin, you said that it's  
18 your understanding that Planned Parenthood South  
19 Atlantic performs an ultrasound on every single  
20 pregnant patient before they provide that pregnant  
21 patient with a chemical abortion, just sometimes when  
22 they do the ultrasound it's indeterminate so you have  
23 a pregnancy of unknown location. Is that your  
24 understanding?

25 A. My understanding is that the law in North

1 Carolina -- again, not an expert on laws, specifically  
2 not in states where I don't practice. But my  
3 understanding of the law in North Carolina is that an  
4 ultrasound is required for each patient to access  
5 abortion care.

6 Now, certainly, as people are nervous about  
7 limits and bans on when they're able to access  
8 abortion care, there are certainly patients -- we've  
9 seen this for sure after the Dobbs decision, people  
10 making appointments earlier and earlier in pregnancy  
11 because they're worried they won't be able to access  
12 that care.

13 Q. Yeah. I'm trying ---

14 A. Then naturally, as far as, you know, how  
15 pregnancies progress, many of those people will be  
16 diagnosed with a pregnancy of unknown location because  
17 we don't reasonably expect to see an -- see a  
18 pregnancy on ultrasound, regardless of where it's  
19 growing.

20 Q. Fair enough. My question to you is, I  
21 thought I understood you to say that when you read  
22 Dr. Farris's declarations in this case that it's your  
23 understanding that she said every single patient who  
24 gets a chemical abortion in the Planned Parenthood  
25 South Atlantic clinic has an ultrasound taken of them



1 before they are given that medication. Is that  
2 correct?

3 A. My understanding of the protocol I'm  
4 specifically referring to in her declaration is about  
5 people who have been diagnosed with a pregnancy of  
6 unknown location.

7 That diagnosis can only happen -- a patient  
8 is -- has a pregnancy. We can diagnose a pregnancy  
9 with a urine pregnancy test, but we can't -- we can't  
10 diagnosis -- diagnose a pregnancy of unknown location  
11 unless we've -- unless we've -- unless the patient has  
12 had ultrasound.

13 Q. Or you can simply not take an ultrasound,  
14 and every patient without an ultrasound has a  
15 pregnancy of unknown location, right?

16 A. No.

17 Q. No?

18 A. No. A patient who hasn't had an ultrasound  
19 but has had confirmation of a pregnancy, for example,  
20 most commonly with a urine pregnancy test, that  
21 patient just has a pregnancy.

22 Q. I think you said this, and I promise this is  
23 my last one here. I just want to confirm.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. Don't believe me because I'm a lawyer, but

1 I'm pretty sure this is my last question.

2 You're saying that every patient at Planned  
3 Parenthood South Atlantic who gets chemical abortion  
4 drugs has had an ultrasound. Is that your  
5 understanding?

6 A. My understanding is that the law requires  
7 ultrasound prior to abortion care in North Carolina.

8 Q. So that law, I believe, that you're talking  
9 about is currently enjoined, which, fancy legal word,  
10 means it's basically on the shelf until this hearing  
11 coming up at the end of September.

12 So are you saying that you think every  
13 single patient -- see, I told you I was going to ask  
14 another question -- every single patient at Planned  
15 Parenthood South Atlantic in North Carolina has an  
16 ultrasound because of that law or because of what you  
17 saw in Dr. Farris's declaration, which is it?

18 A. Dr. ---

19 MS. GRANDIN: Objection to form and  
20 calls for a legal conclusion.

21 THE WITNESS: Dr. Farris's declaration  
22 describes the protocol they use to help treat patients  
23 that are diagnosed with a -- a pregnancy of unknown  
24 location. And again, in order to diagnose a pregnancy  
25 of unknown location, a person would have to have an

1 ultrasound.

2 MR. BOYLE: Okay. I don't think I have  
3 any further questions.

4 THE COURT REPORTER: Anybody else?

5  
6 All right. This concludes the deposition.  
7 The time is 3:34 p.m.

8  
9 WHEREUPON, at 3:34 o'clock p.m., the  
10 deposition was adjourned.

CERTIFICATION

I, Gretchen Wells, Notary Public in and for the  
County of Iredell, State of North Carolina at Large, do  
hereby certify:

That said witness appeared before me, via video  
conference, at the time and place herein aforementioned  
and the foregoing consecutively numbered pages are a  
complete and accurate record of all the testimony given  
by said witness;

That the witness has executed a Declaration, which  
is attached as an exhibit hereto, and who made an  
attestation through this declaration that their testimony  
is truthful under the penalty of perjury;

That the undersigned is not of kin, nor in anywise  
associated with any of the parties to said cause of  
action, nor their counsel, and not interested in the  
event(s) thereof.

Reading and signing of the testimony was requested.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my  
hand this 4th day of September, 2023.



Notary No. 202110400230

WITNESS CERTIFICATION

I, CHRISTY MARIE BORAAS ALSLEBEN, MD, do hereby  
certify,

That I have read and examined the contents of the  
foregoing pages of record of testimony as given by me  
at the times and place herein aforementioned;

And that to the best of my knowledge and belief,  
the foregoing pages are a complete and accurate record  
of all the testimony given by me at said time, except  
as noted on the attached here (Addendum A).

I have \_\_\_\_ / have not \_\_\_\_ made changes/corrections  
to be attached.

\_\_\_\_\_  
(WITNESS SIGNATURE)

I, \_\_\_\_\_, Notary Public  
for the County of \_\_\_\_\_, State of  
\_\_\_\_\_, do hereby certify:

That the herein-above named personally appeared  
before me this the \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 20\_\_\_\_;

And that I personally witnessed the execution  
of this document for the intents and purposes herein  
above described.

My Commission Expires:

\_\_\_\_\_  
NOTARY PUBLIC  
(SEAL)

Upon the reading and examination of my testimony as herein transcribed, I note the following changes and/or corrections with accompanying reason(s) for said change/correction:

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.